

SUMMER ANALYSIS 2019

Parking Report

Summer Study 19-01
City Manager's Office
August 2019

Summer Analysis: Parking Report

Stabilizing and Improving Operations

Executive Summary

This report:

- finds that there have been several analyses done that have recommend expansion of the City's parking operations, but for lack of stability, little implementation,
- lists action steps, in the order in which they will occur,
- summarizes the current revenue streams from parking and how such funds are utilized.
- References a comparison of the fees charged for public parking in Hallandale Beach to the fees charged in other municipalities,
- projects the additional revenues that will be obtained via an increase in the parking fees,
- explains the potential for increased revenues by location or lot,
- analyzes current enforcement efforts and the plan to improve it, and
- reviews residential permit parking programs options and suggests how such a program should be implemented in Hallandale Beach.

Challenge

The challenge of managing and charging a fee for public parking in Hallandale Beach is one of scale. The City's demand for and inventory of public parking may not currently be large enough to fund and dedicate full time employees. However, there is enough demand and enough of an inventory of paid spaces to warrant a paid parking program. Thus, a team consisting of staff from the various departments involved must be established. The team must stabilize the existing program and then build on its progress to grow the program. Outside providers are currently utilized and may need to be relied on even more.

As is evident by the number of analyses and studies done in the last three years relating to parking, the Administration believes this is an area of opportunity. Whether it has been made difficult by an analysis paralysis, letting perfection get in the way of performance, or constant change in the administrative leadership, it appears that significant changes that could lead to an improved public parking in the city are still awaiting implementation.

Existing Conditions

The City's metered parking program is authorized by Chapter 28, Article IV of City Code (Exhibit #1). It has not been updated since 1980. Typically a city updates its parking ordinance as the regulated locations change and grow, as rates and procedures are revised, and as technology changes. The initial parking program in Hallandale beach was for beachfront parking and called for a parking meter at each parking space. An update to the Code is necessary.

What is working

While the City's regulations are not up to date, the existing "PayByPhone" app that has been implemented works well. Public use of it is substantial without much guidance or signage. The paper and printers on the meters work well to provide customers their receipt and to provide a record of the funds withdrawn from the meter. In addition, the special event, flat fee parking events the city manages a few times per year brings in more than enough revenue to cover the cost of providing the service.

What needs improvement

Enforcement, as discussed below, is the area in which the most improvement is needed. Reliability of the technology involved is another area in which improvement could be achieved. Finally, due to transitions in leadership, proactive management of parking, in terms of stabilizing it, making technical progress, and growing the program has been an implementation challenge.

The amount/location of metered spaces can and should be expanded. Potential sites include Diana Drive, the public Marina, the Scavo Park vicinity, Atlantic Shores Blvd., NE 3rd Street, Bluesten Park, and around the Public Works Compound/Eighth Avenue Commons location.

Fee comparison

A fee comparison is attached as Exhibit #2. While the City's rates are comparable to surrounding communities, a fee increase aimed at charging the optimal rate for the most customers will be proposed in the near future.

Residential Parking Program

Particularly in the Diana Drive and Atlantic Shores Blvd. locations, there is a need for a residential parking program. Numerous examples of this type of regulation are under review by staff. The model that best fits the needs in Hallandale Beach will be brought forward for inclusion in the updated ordinance and implementation.

Current Enforcement Procedures

Currently the Pay-By-Plate requirement utilized for at the City's metered parking locations is enforced by Police Officers and Community Service Aids when such staff resources are available to do so. The operation involves a query of a web-based listing of license plate that have paid a current fee to park. The listing is maintained by a vendor to whom the City pays a monthly fee. If the license plate is not found on the list of paid vehicles it is assumed that the parking fee was not paid. This system has been found to be somewhat unreliable. It is also an inefficient use of human resources trained for a higher level of expectation. A plate reader utilized by an individual trained for and dedicated to parking enforcement would be more efficient.

If a vehicle is found to be parked illegally (without having paid the fee) a ticket is issued. The lack of consistency with which parking enforcement occurs results in less compliance with the fee requirements. It is estimated that the revenues which go unrealized as a result might exceed what it will cost to engage a private operation to consistently enforce the parking fees.

Current Revenue Status

Parking revenue is received into the Transportation Fund (160). While revenue from parking is unrestricted, Transportation Funds are restricted in their use. Practically, this has not been problematic as the need for Transportation Fund expenditures continues to exceed the revenues it receives. Conceptually, however, self-imposing restrictions on funds is a practice the City should strive to avoid.

While the revenues from parking are received by the Transportation Division, the operations of the parking management are by and large General Fund expenditures.

TABLE 1: ANNUAL PARKING MANAGEMENT REVENUE – All to Fund 160 (Trans) (Average from FY 17, FY 18, and 19 projection)	
Meters	
South City Beach Park	\$140,000 conservative
North City Beach Park	\$86,000 conservative
Scavo Park	\$4,600
Special Events/Holiday*	\$19,000
Parking Passes	\$3,500
Other	
Tickets (revenue to what fund)	
Total	\$230,000 (after taxes)

*based on 2 years

TABLE 2: ANNUAL PARKING MANAGEMENT EXPENSES BY FUND (Average from FY 17, FY 18, & 19 projection)		
Recurring Expenses include Salary for meter collections Salary for enforcement Salary for Technical Set-Up Salary for Accounting Supplies Parking Pass mgmt Holiday Parking OT Costs Credit Card Fees	General Fund	Other Funds*
Total	\$8,000**	\$24,000

*Transportation and Water Utility

** As far as can be determined, likely too low

As shown by Tables 1 and 2, having all of the revenues from parking deposited in the Transportation Funds means that the General Fund is subsidizing the Transportation Fund. Furthermore, the program costs are not tracked as the employees performing the functions involved are not tracked and charged to the Transportation Fund. As the parking program is

expanded, tracking of the costs will become integral to its operations and a true cost/benefit determination will be possible.

Recommendations

Increase rates

Expand Parking Opportunities

Establish a Parking Team

Adopt a residential parking management program

Invest in order to progress and grow

Attached are two reports about parking – one (exhibit #2) shows parking rates at neighboring cities ranging between \$0.50/hour and \$4.00/hour. The other report (Exhibit #3) shows the potential for approximately 200 additional paid parking spaces amongst three locations.

Based upon the two reports as well as several broad assumptions*, some very rough calculations of estimated parking program revenues and expenditures:

200 parking spaces X \$2 per hour X 10 hours per day, used 50% of the time for 365 days per year= \$730,000 per year revenue

Capital Costs Year 1 = \$100,000 (create metered parking spaces and purchase parking enforcement equipment – meters, signage, lprs, etc.)

Annual Operating costs for maintenance and enforcement (\$500 per space) = \$100,000

Assumptions:

1. Expanded program in operation by July 1, 2020.
2. Parking must be paid for during a 10-hour period each day, every day of the year.
3. Parking spots are utilized by paying customers half of the time
4. Assumes no revenue from fines
5. The rate is set at \$2 per hour
6. No additional staff is needed other than two part-time parking enforcers provided by outside vendor (35 hours per week each)
 - a. Public Works assumes maintenance of meters, signage and spaces
 - b. Finance assumes operation and oversight of revenue stream
 - c. City Attorney's Office assists with appeals
 - d. Police Department assumes management of enforcers and their vehicle operations
 - e. City Manager's Office facilitates coordination between PW, Finance, PD, and CAO.

Suggestion:

Considering the numerous assumptions/uncertainties a conservative approach be employed. Estimate a year-1 additional revenue of \$200,000 and budget an expense of \$200,000 for start-up costs. While this approach does not include an overall net increase on the revenue side, it will facilitate the necessary parking program expansion and allow for the program to become a more predictable cost center and revenue source in future years' budgets. The new \$200,000 parking program expenses ought to be included within the Transportation Division for at least the coming year.

Next Steps

Adopt new rates. Implement new parking locations. Enhance enforcement efforts. Continue team meetings. Establish policies and procedures.

Residential Permit Program recommendations based on what other cities have done e.g. Miami Beach,

Enforcement and the budget required for 7-day operations.,

Update ordinance to include proposed locations of new metered parking.

South Beach Beach Meter Transaction History Analysis

Meter Locations	Month	Payment Type	# of Transactions	Avg. # of Transactions per Day	Total Transaction Amt
HALL-S-LOT1	Oct-16	Credit Card	947	31	\$ 3,039.27
HALL-S-LOT1	Oct-16	Coin	664	21	\$ 924.40
HALL-S-LOT2	Oct-16	Credit Card	716	23	\$ 2,518.98
HALL-S-LOT2	Oct-16	Coin	505	16	\$ 746.25
SOUTH BEACH-7002	Oct-16	Mobile Pmt	89	3	\$ 353.10
HALL-S-LOT1	Oct-17	Credit Card	680	22	\$ 1,661.83
HALL-S-LOT2	Oct-17	Credit Card	188	6	\$ 428.76
SOUTH BEACH-7002	Oct-17	Mobile Pmt	148	5	\$ 545.77
HALL-S-LOT1	Nov-16	Credit Card	1245	42	\$ 4,220.66
HALL-S-LOT1	Nov-16	Coin	453	15	\$ 700.50
HALL-S-LOT2	Nov-16	Credit Card	735	25	\$ 2,609.96
HALL-S-LOT2	Nov-16	Coin	698	23	\$ 1,081.35
SOUTH BEACH-7002	Nov-16	Mobile Pmt	141	5	\$ 658.95
HALL-S-LOT1	Nov-17	Credit Card	1433	48	\$ 3,676.19
HALL-S-LOT2	Nov-17	Credit Card	1005	34	\$ 2,708.07
SOUTH BEACH-7002	Nov-17	Mobile Pmt	117	4	\$ 397.61
HALL-S-LOT1	Dec-16	Credit Card	1233	40	\$ 4,068.98
HALL-S-LOT1	Dec-16	Coin	415	13	\$ 619.95
HALL-S-LOT2	Dec-16	Credit Card	937	30	\$ 3,297.39
HALL-S-LOT2	Dec-16	Coin	572	18	\$ 770.15
SOUTH BEACH-7002	Dec-16	Mobile Pmt	148	5	\$ 720.01
HALL-S-LOT1	Dec-17	N/A	-	-	\$ -
HALL-S-LOT2	Dec-17	Credit Card	148	5	\$ 509.20
HALL-S-LOT2	Dec-17	Coin	58	2	\$ 97.25
SOUTH BEACH-7002	Dec-17	Mobile Pmt	446	14	\$ 1,601.21
Total Transactions per Day Oct 16- Dec 16			9498	103	\$ 26,329.90
Total Transactions per Day Oct 17- Dec 17			4223	46	\$ 11,625.89



City of Hallandale Beach Parking Services Operational Support Matrix

Interface	Operation	Finance	Parks & Rec.	I.T.	Police	D.P.W	City Manager's Office
PayByPhone							
	User Administration		S	P			
	App Issue		S	P			
	Reconciliation	P					
	Contracts and Service Agreements		S				P
	Configuration		S	P			
Parkeon Meters							
	Collection of Revenue		P				
	Paper replacement		P	S			
	Service Parts		P	S			
	Preliminary Troubleshooting Machine		P	S			
	Contacting Consolidated (Maintenance Vendor)		S	P			
	Reconciliation	P					
	Machine Configuration		S	P			
	User Administration		S	P			
User Issues							
	Citation Issue				P		
	Parking Meter Issue		P	S			
	Refund Processing/Policy	P					
Other							
	Issue Citations				P		
	Report Montly Citations Activity				P		
	Report Revenue	P					
	Signage		P				
	Promotion		S	P			

Notes

UPDATES

Collecting twice per week. Greg propose to
steve, training for Parks Staff
Gather funding from DPW - Steve Approval

Revenue collection done.
DONE

Finance in process with this item

Reschedule training

Confirm if Parkeon speaks to PayByPhone

DONE

NO REFUND - Finance to investigate further

Direct customers to Credit Company to
handle dispute with chrages. Emil would look
into drafting policy

NO REFUND . Check for pdf or redesign. Signs
go up until...

Signs needed for spots in Scavo

Proposed Parking

Regulatory

Program

The City of Hallandale Beach

Contents

Abstract.....	3
Current Parking Methodologies.....	4
Provision, Revenue Collection and Customer Service	4
Enforcement and Revenue Collection	4
Parking Compliance	4
Parking Enforcement and Revenue Collection	5
Clerk of Courts –Revenue Allocation	5
Analysis of Known Parking Issues	6
Atlantic Shores Boulevard.....	6
Diana Drive.....	7
Parking Programming Best Practices	8
Comparison with Similar Cities and Best Practices.....	8
Residential Parking.....	8
Parking Meter Pricing Strategies.....	8
Revenue Collection	9
Outsource Parking Administration.....	9
The estimated cost of outsourcing Parking Administration to Pay by Phone	9
Magistrate Program Design	11
Implementing a Magistrate Program.....	11
Conclusion.....	12
Outsource Parking Revenue Collections	12
Public/Private Partnership (P3).....	14
Build a Beach Parking Garage	15
Walkable City	15
Control and Manage Ride Services	16

Abstract

A working group was formed within the Police Department to research current parking programs and formulate a response to Memorandum CM 18 – 152: Study to Create a Parking Regulatory Function in the Police Department. This workgroup included members of the Patrol Operations Division. The group compiled and summarized current city parking, researched comparable city parking plans, identified competitive vendors, and provided Best Practice strategies for addressing and resolving this issue. This White Paper is presented in response to the Memorandum and reflects the recommendations of the team with parking solutions for the City of Hallandale Beach.

Current Parking Methodologies

Provision, Revenue Collection and Customer Service

Enforcement and Revenue Collection

Memorandum CM 18-152 specifically requested “An analysis of the history of formalized parking regulatory functions provided by the Police and other City Departments. To that end, staff identified that there are presently two modalities for managing parking within the City. **Parking Compliance**, provided by City departments and **Enforcement and Revenue Collection**. Historically, the Police Department has enforced parking.

Parking Compliance

The first parking program encompasses all City related administrative functions. This includes provision of marked spaces, signage, revenue collection, equipment support, and communication. This program is led by the Department of Public Works (DPW), in partnership with Innovation Technology (IT) and Parks and Recreation (Parks). In this program, parking spaces are offered and drivers pay coin-operated meters or make a payment via credit card. Credit card payments can be made at the meter or via an app available on a SmartPhone. DPW collects revenue and maintains parking space markings, signage, and meter functionality. IT provides software and hardware support for malfunctioning machines. Parks provides customer service and communicates with Public Works when there are concerns with the parking meters.

Parking Enforcement and Revenue Collection

The second parking methodology in place is Parking Enforcement and the subsequent revenue collection. Parking enforcement is the sole responsibility of the Police Department. Parking Enforcement involves patrol, ticketing, and towing. Citations generate a revenue stream for the City.

Community Service Aides, Parking Enforcement Volunteers, and Police Officers are tasked with enforcing parking regulations (Parking). Enforcement includes issuing handwritten citations, and in some cases, removing the vehicle via the contracted towing vendor.

Tickets are left on the windshield of the violating vehicle and two copies are filed, one with the department and the second copy with the Broward County Clerk of Courts. One copy is held by the Records Unit, thus creating an audit trail for revenue. The second copy is submitted to the Broward County Clerk of Courts. The Clerk of Courts receives and processes payment. In the event that a violation is contested, the violator may request a court appearance which is scheduled and adjudicated through the Clerk of the Courts. The Clerk also administers fines and further penalties.

The current City contract with the Towing provider does not include revenue sharing.

Clerk of Courts –Revenue Allocation

Currently, the City has a contract with the Broward County Clerk of the Courts to collect revenue for parking tickets. The Clerk collects two fees per paid citation:

- \$2.50 per paid citation for the Courts Magistrate Program

Proposed Parking Regulatory Program

- \$5 per citation is allocated for collection, processing and handling.

A total of \$7.50 is deducted from each parking citation. The average parking fine is \$34. A \$4 Crossing Guard Fee is collected and deposited into the General Fund. After Clerk of Court reductions, on average the City collects \$22.50 per parking citation.

Analysis of Known Parking Issues

Atlantic Shores Boulevard

Atlantic Shores Boulevard offers 247 parking spaces on the North and South sides of the boulevard between NE 8 Avenue and NE 12 Avenue (Appendix A). Parking is primarily utilized by the residents of nearby condominiums. As a general rule, the condominiums that line Atlantic Shores Boulevard offer only one parking space per unit. Staff has found that typically each unit has more than one resident, and therefore more than one vehicle. Parking demand outstrips availability.

When seasonal residents arrive, annually November through April, demand for parking increases. Seasonal residents often arrive with multiple vehicles and tend to have guests, further straining limited parking. Staff has observed annually a sharp spike in resident complaints, during this period of time of year, as parking along the boulevard becomes scarce. Full time residents complain regularly that they cannot find available parking near their residences.

It should be noted that commercial parking within this zone is limited to day-time use only.

Diana Drive

Diana Drive is a mixed use street with both residential and commercial zoning. Compared to Atlantic Shores Boulevard, Diana Drive offers a mere 61 parking spaces. Condominiums line the south side of the roadway. The north side of the street is lined with the many multi-level buildings which offer mixed-use commercial businesses. The rear of these buildings face Diana Drive. Here as well, residences often offer limited parking spaces for their residents, where one car will be accommodated on property and an additional vehicle will not. This forces residents and guests to seek street parking.

In 2016, the Beach Walk Resort was completed at the east end of the Diana Drive. The guests of the resort avoid paying for the valet service and instead utilize the street parking. In addition, transport services such as taxis, Uber, and Lyft line the street waiting for fares. So along Diana Drive, like Atlantic Shores Boulevard, parking space demand outstrips supply and residents express complaints at the lack of available parking near their residence.

Parking Programming Best Practices

Comparison with Similar Cities and Best Practices

Staff met with representatives from the City of Hollywood, the City of Miami Beach and the City of Surfside. All three cities shared their Parking Department programs. Staff gained access to considerable Best Practices in parking programming. All three of these cities have found balance between the needs of visitors and residents. These cities allow metered parking during the daytime, restrict visitor parking in residential neighborhoods during the evening hours and have deployed a parking permit program for residents.

Residential Parking

Miami Beach is divided into multiple parking zones. Residents apply for a parking placard by showing multiple proofs of residency. Attachment of the placard allows the resident to park within their residential zone only. During the day, residential zones are open, however, after 6pm, only residents can park their vehicle(s) in their assigned residential parking zone, until 6am the following morning. The residents who participate in the permit program have a city decal identifying the vehicle as a resident and are registered and documented through an electronic parking database. On average, the residential permit has a recurring annual fee between \$10 and \$50.

Parking Meter Pricing Strategies

The most common parking rates range between \$2/Hr. and \$4/Hr. for the local municipalities. The rates fluctuate by location and/or day of the week. The highest fees

were charged on weekend days. The fees also change based on demand, for example, all cities reported “special events” pricing.

Revenue Collection

Collection of revenues appeared to be consistent overall with the City’s employed parking meters, resident parking programs and the Pay by Phone service. The Town of Surfside appears to be most similar to the City of Hallandale Beach with regards to the amount of parking spaces; however, after speaking with Surfside, staff learned of their plan to phase-out metered parking over the next two years. This decision was made due to the popularity of the Pay by Phone application, ease of service, the advantage of removing meter maintenance and enhanced fund collection.

Outsource Parking Administration

The estimated cost of outsourcing Parking Administration to Pay by Phone

Pay by Phone is a successful parking administration vendor that provides revenue management. Pay by Phone has increasingly become the more popular method for parking payments. This method allows users to conveniently pay for parking using an application on a smart phone or by calling a phone number. This application makes parking compliance simpler to maintain with a minimal start-up cost and recurring operational costs. Further, this method increases the likelihood of space availability and compliance by allowing customers an easy way to make recurring payments by alerting them prior to time expiration. Once the application is downloaded on the customer’s phone, the user only has

to enter the “zone” number provided on the sign posted in the immediate location, provide the vehicle’s tag number, and request the time allotment needed. The payment will automatically be deducted from the user’s credit card on file through Pay by Phone’s secured site. This application is user friendly and only requires a minimal amount of effort on the user’s part. It also eliminates the need for the user to carry cash or coins for a meter therefore creating a more pleasant experience.

Pay by Phone is ideal for parking enforcement, the Enforcement Officer equipped with the vendor’s database can locate a violation and issue a citation. The License Plate Reader (LPR) is a vehicle mounted camera that utilizes scanning technology and is capable of covering significantly more spaces per hour. As the officer patrols the City, the LPR scans the tags of parked vehicles and compares them to the Pay by Phone database to identify expired meters. Once the officer locates a violation, they utilize the hand-held unit to issue and print the citation. An alternate to the hand-held unit is a printer installed in the patrol vehicle.

Implementing a Pay by Phone program involves deploying several pieces of hardware: a hand-held device for enforcement staff, a license plate reader (LPR), and signage. We will review each element and then discuss the accompanying software.

Estimated costs utilizing Pay by Phone would be \$150 monthly per zone, with a total estimated cost of \$1500 per month (ten parking zones). Pricing for the product can be negotiated and is subject to marketing/sales strategies. Pay by Phone functions as the Merchant of Record. Outsourcing this functionality will significantly reduce the City’s involvement in revenue administration (collection, accounting, monitoring, customer

service, and IT support). Pay by Phone would also handle all credit card fees incurred and make direct payment to the City. This would reduce personnel costs and eliminate work for DPW, IT, and Parks staff.

Pay by Phone provides all necessary parking related signage at no cost to the City. Signage would be necessary, however, indicating the program. The installation of the signage can be accomplished through DPW and each sign pole costs approximately \$32. Parking Enforcement will carry a hand held unit to monitor, enforce and cite violators. Each hand-held unit is approximately \$5000, totaling approximately \$30,000 for six (6) units.

The cost of purchasing a mobile LPR is approximately \$25,000 per unit which would include installation, licensing, and software; totaling approximately \$50,000 to equip two (2) vehicles. The LPR software has a reoccurring \$500 per camera annual licensing fee. The City would not incur additional enforcement costs by utilizing current Police Department fleet vehicles, and by adding this additional task to existing personnel there would be no additional personnel cost.

The total first year costs for implementing a parking program is \$111,200. (Appendix B)

Magistrate Program Design

Implementing a Magistrate Program

At the present time, the City is in a contract with the Broward County Clerk of the Courts, which processes and collects all parking citations issued pursuant to the City's parking ordinances. In addition, the Clerk also provides a magistrate program in which a Judicial Hearing Officer hears contested parking citations for adjudication.

After consulting with the City Attorney, it is noted that this program can easily be allowed to continue as the Broward County Clerk of the Courts offers efficiencies of scale.

Conclusion

Having had the opportunity to assess current parking demand and to identify and research local Best Practices, we recommend the following:

Outsource Parking Revenue Collections

The recommendation in this white paper is that the City of Hallandale Beach should exclusively use single-source Pay by Phone to facilitate parking compliance. Pay by Phone has increasingly become the more popular method for parking payments. This method allows users to conveniently pay for parking using an application on a smart phone or by calling a phone number. This application makes parking compliance simpler to maintain with a minimal start-up cost and recurring operational costs. Further, this method increases the likelihood of space availability and compliance by allowing customers an easy way to make recurring payments by alerting them prior to time expiration. Once the application is downloaded on the customer's phone, the user only has to enter the "zone" number provided on the sign posted in the immediate location, provide the vehicles tag number, and request the time allotment needed. The payment will automatically be deducted from the user's credit card on file through Pay by Phone's secured site. This application is user friendly and only requires a minimal amount of effort on the user's part. It also eliminates

the need for the user to carry cash or coins for a meter therefore creating a more pleasant experience.

Pay by Phone is ideal for parking enforcement, the Enforcement Officer in possession of a hand-held device to locate the violation and issue a citation. The License Plate Reader (LPR) is a more efficient way to locate and identify parking violations. LPR technology simplifies the process of identifying parking violations, and equips the Enforcement Officer with the information they need to issue citations. Vehicle mounted cameras cover significantly more spaces per hour, expanding the total patrol area each day. In addition, the use of LPR systems often creates more stringent parking compliance.

Staff is recommending the continued use of the Broward County Clerk of the Courts for processing and adjudicating parking citations.

An educational and awareness initiative is paramount to provide information and support for the parking program and to gain more participants in the Residential Permit Program. This initiative should consist of a mass mailing to all the residents in the City with an approved message and information on how to register. City staff would also utilize the City website and social media to disseminate this information to visitors and residents. City staff would also meet with homeowner associations and community groups to provide further information on the new parking program. For the first three months of the program, City Staff would be present in high traffic parking areas such as the beach parking to answer any questions.

Finally, Pay by Phone allows the most effectual process for instituting a Residential Permit Program. Prompted by the educational campaign, residents would respond to the police

department to register for the Residential Permit Program. The resident would show proof of residency, pay the annual permit fee (ranging from \$10 to \$50 set by City Commission) and would be assigned to a parking zone. Once registered, the resident would be exempt from having to pay for parking in their registered zone during billing hours. The resident would be able to park in the residential parking zone during the allotted time. The Enforcement Officer would be able to identify that the vehicle is authorized to park in the parking zone by scanning the resident's vehicle tag number.

We recommend that restrictions on commercial vehicle parking should remain in effect as outlined in the current City Municipal Ordinances which restricts any commercial vehicles to park in any residential area between 9pm and 6am. In addition, commercial vehicles cannot load or unload between 9pm and 8am.

Public/Private Partnership (P3)

Staff recommends the City approach the Trans Capital Bank and inquire if they are receptive to a public private partnership. The Trans Capital Bank parcel at 2100 East Hallandale Beach Boulevard currently has a two-story parking structure that offers approximately 200 parking spaces. Staff recommends investigating two possible scenarios: expanding the floors of the parking structure to add two additional floors. The average cost of a parking garage floor is \$1.1 million, and adding two floors would cost the City approximately \$2.2 to \$2.5 million, depending on the soundness of the original structure. The additional spaces could be then leased monthly to residents and guests.

Build a Beach Parking Garage

Staff recommends building a four-story parking garage on City owned property on South City Beach. Currently, the plot offers 115 parking spaces. Each floor of a parking garage can offer 100 parking spaces, thus increasing parking by 285 parking spaces. This can greatly lead to balancing demand and supply of parking spaces on the beach. Projected cost to construct a four-story parking garage is \$7.5 million.

An RFP can be managed by the City to solicit vendors. Combining two parking garage construction projects into one project, can potentially net the City savings and efficiencies of scale by contracting one vendor. Additionally, spaces can be leased to residents and daily overflow parking can be offered.

Walkable City

Staff recognizes the Mobility Plan that the City is currently engaged in expanding and implementing. Staff recommends continuing to seek avenues to increase mobility within the City. Vendors such as Zip Car, City Bike, and Segway provides residents and visitors mobility options within the City without the need to have a vehicle, thus decreasing parking demand.

Control and Manage Ride Services

Staff recommends creating spaces marked ride-share in each parking zone. Once occupied, other ride-share drivers will have to circle until they pick up their fare. Use of a residential or metered space will be a citation event.

Appendix A

The following is a list of areas which have on street parking, along with City owned property which has public parking lots. It also suggests the zone assignment for each area.

ZONE 1

Atlantic Shores Boulevard:

NE 8 Avenue east to NE 10 Avenue	122 spaces
NE 10 Avenue east to NE 12 Avenue	100 spaces
Diplomat Parkway east to Three Islands Blvd.	25 spaces

ZONE 2

Scavo Park:

Three Islands Blvd	61 spaces
--------------------	-----------

Three Islands Marina:

20 spaces

ZONE 3

Diana Drive:

NE 26 Avenue west to Golden Isles Drive	61 spaces
---	-----------

Golden Isles Drive:

77 spaces

ZONE 4

NE 14 Avenue:

53 spaces

ZONE 5

South City Beach: 115 spaces

ZONE 6

NE 1 Avenue: 28 spaces

ZONE 7

BF James Park:

NW 1 Avenue 25 spaces

NW 2 Avenue 25 spaces

Foster Park: 25 spaces

OB Johnson Park: N.E. 7th Terrace 23 spaces

ZONE 8

Cultural Center:

Public Parking Utilized during “Special Events” 113 spaces

ZONE 9

City Municipal Complex:

Public Parking Utilized during “Special Events” 28 spaces

(Not to interfere with Police Parking)

ZONE 10

City Library:

Public Parking Utilized during “Special Events” 68 spaces

Total available parking spaces which can be metered: 969 spaces.

Appendix B:

The startup cost for the parking program will total \$111,200. The costs are attributed to:

Item	Number	Amount	Total
License Plate Reader	(2)	\$25,000	\$50,000
Handheld Device	(6)	\$5,000	\$30,000
Sign poles	(100)	\$32	\$3,200
Zone Contract	(10 zones)	\$150/month	\$18,000/year
Communications Campaign		\$10,000	\$10,000
			\$111,200

The communication campaign is an Educational and Awareness Campaign that includes printing and binding for a mass mailing.

CITY OF HALLANDALE BEACH

MEMORANDUM

DATE: April 24, 2019
TO: Greg Chavarria, City Manager
FROM: Vanessa Leroy, Development Services Director
SUBJECT: Parking Rate Survey

At the direction of the City Manager, Development Services surveyed nearby cities for their metered public parking rates. The following report will provide parking information from seven nearby Broward and Miami Dade County municipalities, namely: Fort Lauderdale, Dania Beach, Hollywood, Miami Beach, Pompano Beach, Coral Gables, Sunny Isles Beach. The cities of Aventura, Sunrise, Pembroke Pines and towns of Davie and Pembroke Park do not currently offer metered public parking. In short, parking rates range from \$0.5/hour to \$4/hour, depending on parking structure/type, location and the municipality.

Parking Meters

Various meter payment options were noted: multi-space meters, single-space meters and pay-by-phone meter parking.

- Multi-space meters are fixed meter devices that can manage a multitude of parking spaces in a one block area or designated parking lot which will require a plate number or parking space number.
- Single-space meters are designed only to manage one parking space and are devices found directly next to each parking space. These typically required payment with coins.
- Pay-by-phone meters are signs posted in a designed parking area which will require the person parking in the space to use their phone to pay for space. Pay-by-phone meters will require the plate number and a credit/debit card to pay for space.

City of Hallandale Beach (Rate: \$1.00 to \$2.50/hr)

The City of Hallandale Beach provides public parking spaces with multi-space meters at North Beach, South Beach and Scavo parks. The North Beach Park parking facility charges \$2.50 per hour for 42 metered spaces. This excludes 41 parking spaces that are committed to Etaru Restaurant and 5 free ADA (Americans with Disability Act) spaces. The South Beach Park parking lot also charges \$2.50 per hour for 113 metered spaces. This excludes 6 ADA (Americans with Disability Act) spaces that are free of charge. City of Hallandale Beach residents also have the option of an annual parking pass for \$300 a year at the Beach parks. Joseph Scavo Park currently has 17 on-street metered parking spaces charged at a rate of \$1.00 per hour.

City of Fort Lauderdale (Rate Range: \$0.50 to \$1.75/hr)

The city of Fort Lauderdale has approximately 7,066-meter spaces. The city has 226 multi-space meters, 1,102 single-space meters, and 72 Pay by Phone only parking spaces. The revenue of these spaces brought in \$12.5 million in the Fiscal year 2018 for the city. The City of Fort Lauderdale charges different rates based on the parking location: parking lot and on-street parking, parking garages, and beach parking. The rates vary from \$0.50 to \$1.75 per hour with a max time length ranging from 3 to 4 hours.

City of Dania Beach (Rate Range: \$2.00/hr)

The City of Dania Beach uses digital multi-space meters and Passport mobile pay app which is a pay-by-phone service. The City has 12 meters which cover beach parking and the parking garage at city hall. All these meters charge the same rate of \$2.00 per hour. This brings on average of \$1.7 million each year.

The City of Hollywood (Rate Range: \$1.50 to \$4.00/hr)

The City of Hollywood has 293 meters which include 153 multi-space meters and 140 single-space meters. The city also has Parkmobile which is a pay-by-phone service that allows to call or use an app on a mobile phone and pay for the parking space. The city's parking division manages and operates approximately 4,164 public spaces both on and off-street city-wide, 20 surface parking lots, and 59 space Recreational Storage Facility Lot. The revenue the meters brings in each year is \$6,273,462 for multi-space meters and Parkmobile and \$394,040 for single-space meters. The city charges different rates for resident and non-residents with higher rates on the weekend. Hollywood residents beach rate- Mon-Thu \$1.50/Hr, Fri-Sun- \$2.00/Hr, non-residents beach rate- Mon-Thu- \$3.00/Hr, Fri-Sun- \$4.00/Hr, and downtown rate- \$1.50/Hr.

The City of Miami Beach (Rate Range: \$1.00 to 4.00/hr)

The City of Miami Beach is divided into 5 parking zones entertainment district parking zone, south beach parking zone, east middle beach zone, west middle beach zone, north beach zone. The city manages and operates on-street parking, 66 surface parking lots, and 10 garages. The city price ranges from \$1.00/hr to \$4.00/hr. The City of Miami Beach charges more for on-street parking. The entertainment district parking zone and south beach parking zone charge the same at \$2.00/hr for off-street parking and \$4.00/hr for on-street parking. East middle beach zone charges \$2.00/hr for off-street parking and \$3.00/hr for on-street parking. The west middle beach zone and north beach zone charge the same at \$2.00/hr for off-street parking and \$4.00/hr for on-street parking.

The City of Pompano Beach (Rate Range: \$1.00 to \$2.75/hr)

The City of Pompano Beach has multi-space meters, single-space meters and pay-by-phone mobile app. They have 21 multi-space meters, 30 single-space meters and the passport mobile app that lets you put in a parking space number or a plate number. Pompano Beach has approximately 1,500 beach parking. The City divides parking areas into three different zones. Each zone charges different rates depending on if it's off-season, in-season, and holidays/events. The meters rates range from \$1.25 to \$2.75. On-Street Metered Parking rates range from \$1.00 per hour to \$2.50 per hour

The City of Coral Gables (Rate Range: \$1.00 to \$3.00/hr)

The City of Coral Gables has garage parking, on-street parking, and municipal parking lots. For parking garages, the city charges \$1.00 for the first 40 minutes and \$2.00 per 40 minutes after up to \$15. The City charges \$15 for any lost tickets for the garages. On-street metered parking rates range from \$1.00 per hour to \$2.50 per hour. Municipal parking lot rates range from \$1.50 per hour to \$3.00 per hour. Municipal parking lots operate 24 hours per day, 7 days a week. All metered parking is enforced 7 days a week from 9 a.m. to Midnight.

The City Sunny Isles Beach (Rate Range: \$2.00 to \$3.00/hr)

The City Sunny Isles Beach has metered parking throughout Sunny Isles Beach. The rate for most lots is \$2 per hour, however, both the Ellen Wynne & Pier Park lots are \$3 per hour.

_____ Approved _____ Denied _____ Hold for Discussion

CITY OF HALLANDALE BEACH, FLORIDA
MEMORANDUM

DATE: April 26, 2019

TO: Keven Klopp, Assistant City Manager

FROM: Peter A. Kunen, P.E., Asst. Director of Public Works/City Engineer

SUBJECT: Available Parking Opportunities for Diana Drive, Hallandale Beach Marina, & Joseph Scavo Park

I have performed a site visit to these locations and have reviewed the possible opportunities for metered parking.

The number of existing parking spaces were counted, and the parking space dimensions were measured. In addition, Section 32-453 of the City's Code of Ordinances was reviewed as were the possible parking space layouts and angle geometries, to determine optimum parking configurations and space counts for each location.

I have not included handicapped parking in these figures as I am assuming handicapped parking spaces would not be metered.

The summaries on the following pages reflect the possible opportunities for metered parking at these locations.

Diana Drive

There are 60 existing parallel parking spaces located on the south side of the landscaped median, extending from Layne Boulevard east to S.E. 26th Avenue. These parking spaces measure 7' wide x 21' long. The existing roadway geometry would not be conducive for angled parking.



However, by moving the median into the center of the 75' wide right-of-way this road could be reconfigured to allow for angled parking, which may provide up to 105 parking spaces at this location.

Hallandale Beach Marina

There are 26 existing 90° (head-in) parking spaces located at the Marina. These spaces measure 9' wide x 16' long. An additional 10 parallel parking spaces located on the east side of the driveway cul-de-sac could be realized. This could be accomplished by cutting into the existing berm, removing a 10' wide x 200' long strip of landscaping, and constructing a low retaining wall.



An angled parking configuration may also be possible by widening the cul-de-sac and utilizing the existing parking space on the west side. This configuration may provide up to 38 parking spaces along the east and west sides of the cul-de-sac.

Joseph Scavo Park

There are 61 existing parallel parking spaces located on the east and west sides of Three Islands Boulevard in the vicinity of the Park. These spaces measure 10' wide x 22' long.



An angled parking configuration could also be an option, which may provide up to 72 parking spaces for this location. However, there would be a reduction of lane width, which will reduce the width of the current four lane road (two lanes in each direction) down to two lanes (one lane in each direction).