

DRAFT

PLANNING AND ZONING BOARD (PZB) PUBLIC MEETING SUMMARY
WEDNESDAY, APRIL 25, 2019
CITY HALL, COMMISSION CHAMBERS

Board Member Present: Charles Wu, Chair; Howard Garson, Vice Chair; Danny Kattan, Rick Levinson and Diane Lyon Wead

Alternate Present: Bruce McNamara and Faith Fehr

Board Member Absent:

Board Secretary: Cindy Bardales-Villanueva

City Attorney's Representative: Carrie Sarver, Assistant City Attorney

Staff Present: Vanessa Leroy, Christy Dominguez and Cindy Bardales-Villanueva

2018 PZB ATTENDANCE

ATTENDANCE ROLL CALL:

BOARD MEMBERS	1/24	2/28	3/28	4/25	5/23	6/27	7/25	8/22	9/26	10/24	11/26	12/26
Charles Wu- <i>Chair</i>	A	CANCELLED	P	P	P	CANCELLED	P	P	P	P	P	CANCELLED
Howard Garson - <i>Vice Chair</i>	P		P	P	P		P	P	P	P	P	
Rick Levinson			P	P	P		P	P	P	P	P	
Danny Kattan							P	A	P	P	P	
Sheryl Natelson	A											
Terri Dillard	P											
Alexander Lewy	P		P	P	P							
Total Members Present	3		4	4	4		4	3	4	4	4	
Total Members Absent	2		0	0	0		0	1	0	0	0	

2019 PZB ATTENDANCE

BOARD MEMBERS	1/30	2/27	3/27	4/24	5/29	6/26	7/24	8/28	9/25	10/23	11/26	12/26
Charles Wu- <i>Chair</i>	P	CANCELLED	CANCELLED	P	CANCELLED							
Howard Garson - <i>Vice Chair</i>	P			P								
Rick Levinson	P			P								
Danny Kattan	E			P								
Diane Lyon Wead				P								
Faith Fehr- <i>Alternate</i>				P								
Bruce McNamara- <i>Alternate</i>				P								
Total Members Present	3			7								
Total Members Absent	1			0								

ATTENDANCE ROLL CALL:

Present (P)

Absent: (A)

Excused Absence (E)

Tardy: (T)

 Un-appointed

1 **1. CALL TO ORDER**

2
3 Mr. Wu called the meeting to order at 6:36 P.M.

4 **2. ROLL CALL**

5 Mr. Wu: recognized and welcomed new appointed *Board Member*, Ms. Diane Lyon Wead and
6 *Alternates*, Ms. Faith Fehr and Mr. Bruce McNamara sitting in the audience.

7 **3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

8
9 **4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

10 Mr. Wu: commended the Board Secretary on the January 30, 2019 meeting minutes.

11 MR. GARSON MOVED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE JANUARY 30, 2019 PLANNING
12 AND ZONING BOARD MEETING.

13 MR. LEVINSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

14 MOTION PASSED BY A ROLL CALL VOTE (5-0).

15 **5. NEW BUSINESS**

16
17 Application# V-18-01307 by City of Hallandale Beach, Florida requesting a Variance in order to
18 redevelop the existing Golden Isles Park and Tennis Complex with new tennis courts, a 3,500 square
19 foot tennis center building, restrooms, doggie park and other amenities similar to the existing facilities
20 on the property. The property is located at 500 Egret Drive/424 Layne Blvd.

21 The application to be considered is as follows:

22 1. Application# V-18-01307, requesting a Variance from Section 32-384 (c) relative to the minimum
23 number of trees required of one tree for every 1,500 square feet of project site area in order to
24 accommodate the proposed park, tennis facility and improvements.

25 **Polling of Ex Parte Communications (Board Secretary)**

26
27 *Mr. Wu advised that he had no Ex-Parte Communications regarding this matter. He advised he*
28 *would base his decision solely on the testimony being presented.*

29
30 *Mr. Garson advised that he had Ex-Parte Communications regarding this matter. He advised that*
31 *he is active board member for the Park and Recreational Committee and this project has been*
32 *discussed in several occasions. He advised that he would base his decision solely on the testimony*
33 *being presented.*

34
35 *Mr. Kattan advised that he had no Ex-Parte Communications regarding this matter. He advised he*
36 *would base his decision solely on the testimony being presented.*

37
38 *Mr. Levinson advised that he had no Ex-Parte Communications regarding this matter. He advised*
39 *he would base his decision solely on the testimony being presented.*

40
41 *Ms. Wead advised that she had no Ex-Parte Communications regarding this matter. She advised*
42 *he would base his decision solely on the testimony being presented.*

43
44 **Swearing in of Witnesses (Assistant City Attorney)**

45
46

47 Ms. Dominguez provided a Power Point presentation and gave a summary of the item.
48

49 Mr. Kattan: congratulated the architect on the design the project. He expressed that he did not have a
50 problem with the variance but the request to reduce tree counts for the renovation of a park sends the
51 wrong message but can see the challenge to this site.
52

53 Mr. Kattan: cautioned planting trees along the tennis court to prevent from leaves blowing into the court
54 which can lead to damaging the floor.
55

56 Mr. Kattan: proposed adding water fountains and maybe looking into including a concession stand in
57 the near future.
58

59 Ms. Dominguez: acknowledged and introduced Mr. Cathie Schanz, Director of Parks and Recreation,
60 Mr. Gregg Harris, Capital Project Manager and Mr. Chris Phillips, Landscaping Architect (CLS
61 Engineering Services, LLC) for the project, were in attendance and available to answer any questions.
62

63 Mr. Kattan: further added that a car charging station should be considered for the park.
64

65 Ms. Dominguez: clarified that the project is incorporating electric car charging station.
66

67 Mr. Levinson: stated he had a question on staff's condition which states that "the applicant shall
68 incorporate additional trees along the east boundary line of the tennis center site, if feasible, as
69 determined by the project's landscape architect and accepted by the City."
70

71 Ms. Dominguez: clarified that the condition would be based and determined during the building permit
72 review process if it would be feasible since there are utility lines in that area.
73

74 Mr. Garson: pointed out a small error on the cover page, of the architect's plans which lists the current
75 Commission incorrectly.
76

77 Ms. Dominguez: acknowledged and stated the project has been on review for while which might be
78 why this was overlooked.
79

80 Mr. Garson: asked through the Chair to call Mr. Cathie Schanz, Director of Parks and Recreation to the
81 podium. He recognized her hard work and dedication that she has put into the renovation of all of our
82 City's parks.
83

84 Mr. Wu: celebrated the project and recognized the architect and his achievement to cover every space
85 on the property.
86

87 Mr. Wu: further asked if the fitness area was intended for adults or children? And what type of exercise
88 equipment would be used?
89

90 Ms. Schanz: clarified that the fitness center was designed for adult use. She added that the proposed
91 park would be similar to the concept used for Ingalls Park, which has a station trail in multiple areas of
92 the walk path and a workout station over a shaded area.
93

94 Ms. Schanz: added that the type of fitness equipment that would be put in place has not yet been
95 determined.
96

97 Mr. Wu: asked if residents would have accessibility to be able to walk around the whole park?
98

Mr. Harris: confirmed and added that they are proposing an oversize sidewalk around the whole park to not only allow for pedestrians but also cycling.

Mr. Harris: further added that the park also provides for open space areas, such as, the retention area and picnic area surrounding the park.

Mr. Wu: disagreed that the retention area should be counted as open space.

Mr. Harris: stated that the tennis court on the south side of the property and the utility lines to the east of the property limits adding additional trees.

Mr. Kattan: asked if the abutting lot, which belongs to Gulfstream, is entitled to an easement.

Mr. Harris: clarified that there is dedicated a right-of-way if needed.

Mr. Wu: opened the public hearing.

Mr. George Nehme, (Golden Isles, Hallandale Beach FL): stated that he was against the proposed project and had a petition signed by approximately two hundred residents against the project.

Mr. Nehme: recommended that the Board go by and visit the park which is in great condition and does not need renovating, except changing out some pavers. He stated the funds can be utilized to fund programs for children in the City.

Mr. Nehme: further added that the proposed renovation will be closer to the tennis courts, which would be exposed to adults visiting the park that do not have children and susceptible to invite sexual offenders.

Mr. Nehme: stated the proposed renovation would cut down all the current pine trees that bring shade and palm trees and mature trees that will be taken out.

Mr. Harris: stated that removal of pine trees have been put in place by the County and State to remove these types of species because they are invasive and take over wherever they are planted and does not allow anything else to grow around their surrounding area.

Ms. Schanz: stated they will be adding additional water fountains to the park and have designed the park to operate in a way the children are required to have parent supervision. She stated that closing in the playground area of the park would induce parents to leave their children unattended.

Ms. Schanz: advised that the park area will be closed to all residents after dark and the tennis and basketball courts will be closed between 9:00pm and 10:00 pm, the time has not yet been confirmed. She further added that they would have an outside vendor operating the tennis courts and bocce courts.

Mr. Kattan: recommended staff to look into current technology programs being used that can detect sexual offenders by face recognition.

Ms. Wead: asked what the retention open space use was and would it be possible to plant trees there?

Mr. Harris: clarified that the retention area would be used as a new dumping area for rainwater on the site, which would prevent flooding, that being the case, planting any tree on that location would cause uprooting.

151 Ms. Wead: asked if people would be able to walk over the retention area?
152

153 Mr. Harris: yes, when it is dry.
154

155 Ms. Wead: asked if it was mandatory to keep ten tennis courts.
156

157 Mr. Harris: yes.
158

159 Ms. Deborah Degreve (Egret Drive, Hallandale Beach, FL): stated that she lived in the condominium
160 complex nearby and her concern was the noise coming from the park.
161

162 Ms. Susan Lewis: recognized Mr. Harris and Ms. Schanz for the hard work they have put into the
163 project. She stated that she had been to all the community meetings regarding the project and they had
164 been in attendance to listen to residents and take all comments into consideration.
165

166 Ms. Lewis: further added that the Golden Isles Homeowner's Association hosted a picnic at the park in
167 which the project was presented and everyone was excited with the renovations.
168

169 Ms. Lindmile Mashehalkove, (Layne Boulevard, Hallandale Beach, FL): stated she was one of the
170 individuals opposed to this project and her name along with two hundred mothers that share this park
171 are not in favor of the proposed renovation.
172

173 Ms. Mashehalkove: urged the Board to take in consideration the removal of the existing trees that
174 provide shade to the park. She felt that exposing their children to the type of heat should be considered
175 inhumane.
176

177 Mr. Wu: closed the public hearing.
178

179 Mr. Garson: recognized Ms. Mashehalkove's concerns of the renovation to the park. He stated that the
180 point she was bringing before the Board of keeping the invasive tree species, should be a discussion
181 she would have to have with the State of Florida. They were who put in place the regulations to have
182 these type of trees removed.
183

184 Mr. Garson: further stated that the proposed park would have a fence all around but it would be the
185 parent's responsibility to not leave their children unattended. He stated that the park was not designed
186 for any specific age, group or specific demographic.
187

188 Mr. Wu: asked if the site plan to this project had been approved by the City Commission? And what is
189 the time frame of the project being completed?
190

191 Ms. Schanz: confirmed that the site plan was approved by the City Commission and what was on
192 discussion was the variance application regarding the tree requirements. She added that the project is
193 estimated to begin the start of summer and end twelve months from the start date.
194

195 Mr. Levinson: asked what was the possibility to begin construction by phases, allowing residents to use
196 partial sections of the park during the summer?
197

198 Mr. Harris: stated no. He added that whole park would need to be closed completely during
199 construction.
200
201
202

MR. LEVINSON MOVED THAT BASED ON THE COMPETENT AND SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE PRESENTED TODAY, I MOVE THAT THE PLANNING AND ZONING BOARD RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF APPLICATION # V-18-01307 TO GRANT A VARIANCE FROM SECTION 32-384(c), WHICH REQUIRES THE APPLICANT TO PLANT 1 TREE FOR EACH 1,500 SQUARE FEET OF LOT AREA, SUBJECT TO THE CONDITIONS RECOMMENDED BY THE CITY ADMINISTRATION.

Mr. Wu Second for discussion and asked staff if this was a final approval or a recommendation to staff.

Ms. Dominguez: stated yes. The Planning and Zoning Board makes the final decision on this application.

Mr. Wu: stated that the motion needed to be amended to remove recommended.

MR. LEVINSON MOVED THAT BASED ON THE COMPETENT AND SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE PRESENTED TODAY, I MOVE THAT THE PLANNING AND ZONING BOARD APPROVE APPLICATION # V-18-01307 TO GRANT A VARIANCE FROM SECTION 32-384(c), WHICH REQUIRES THE APPLICANT TO PLANT 1 TREE FOR EACH 1,500 SQUARE FEET OF LOT AREA, SUBJECT TO THE CONDITION RECOMMENDED BY THE CITY ADMINISTRATION.

MR. GARSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

MOTION PASSED BY ROLL CALL VOTE (5-0).

6. LIAISON'S REPORT

Ms. Dominguez: announced that Mr. Keven Klopp has been promoted to Interim Assistant City Manager and Vanessa Leroy is Acting Development Services Director.

Ms. Dominguez: briefed the Board on previous application: the West Hallandale Beach Shoppes project and Street Trees Code Amendment have been approved by the City Commission.

7. REMARKS BY THE CHAIR

Mr. Wu: recognized new appointed *Board Member*, Ms. Diane Lyon Wead and Alternates, Ms. Faith Fehr and Mr. Bruce McNamara sitting in the audience.

Ms. Faith Fehr: stated that she also had a questions and would like to know her role as an alternate.

Mr. Wu: advised that the City Attorney's Office and City Clerk's Office are working on clarifying their role and should all be determined by the next meeting.

8. NEXT SCHEDULED MEETING

Ms. Dominguez: stated that due to the rescheduling of a City Commission Meeting which has been set for the same date of our May's Planning and Zoning Board Meeting of May 22, 2019, the next Planning and Zoning Board Meeting needs to be rescheduled. Staff is proposing it be moved from Wednesday, May 22, 2019 to Wednesday, May 29, 2019.

Mr. Kattan: advised that he had a conflict and would not be available on Wednesday, May 29, 2019.

Mr. Wu: stated that Mr. Kattan would be excused since this was unexpected set date and an alternate would be available to attend on his behalf.

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:50 P.M.

Recording of this meeting can be made available to any member of the public upon request. Requests to hear a taping of the Planning and Zoning Board meeting, summarized above, should be submitted to the Planning & Zoning Division at \or can be mailed to 400 South Federal Highway, Hallandale Beach, Florida 33009