



City of Hallandale Beach

City Commission

400 S. Federal Highway
Hallandale Beach, FL 33009
www.cohb.org

Mayor Joy D. Adams
Vice Chair Sabrina Javellana
Commissioner Mike Butler
Commissioner Michele Lazarow
Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub

Interim City Manager Greg Chavarria
City Attorney Jennifer Merino
City Clerk Jenorgen M. Guillen, CMC

Meeting Minutes

Wednesday, February 6, 2019

5:35 PM

Commission Chambers

1. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Mayor Joy D. Adams at 5:30 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Present: 5 - Mayor Joy Adams, Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana, Commissioner Mike Butler, Commissioner Michele Lazarow and Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub

Absent: 0

Interim City Manager Greg Chavarria and City Attorney Jennifer Merino were present.

3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

4. ORDER OF BUSINESS

5. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION (Speakers must sign-in with the City Clerk prior to the start of the meeting)

Shana Gaines, Hallandale Beach resident, spoke regarding 2000 S. Ocean Drive and the beach access.

Joe Fiero, Hollywood resident, spoke on the storage of vehicles.

Development Services Director Keven Klopp briefed the City Commission on the storage of vehicles and the matter in which it was addressed.

Frank LaBanca, Hallandale Beach resident, spoke regarding beach access and the lifeguard station flags.

Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub inquired on the beach closure.

Development Services Director Keven Klopp briefed the City Commission on the beach access. He explained that one (1) beach access is closed due to construction at two (2) adjacent locations where it is no longer feasible for beach access. He explained that the property is private property with a 7.5-foot easement in the care of the City, but Parker Plaza owns it.

Fire Chief Mark Ellis addressed Mr. LaBanca's comments and provided a summary on the lifeguard stands.

Joe Farinola, Hallandale Beach resident, expressed his concern with the ocean walk and beach access.

Regent Towrangea, Hallandale Beach resident, expressed his concern with the 900 Atlantic Shores project design.

Assistant City Manager/Director Steven Parkinson addressed Mr. Towrangea's concern regarding the design.

6. PRESENTATIONS

A. BLACK HISTORY MONTH PROCLAMATION. (SPONSORED BY CITY COMMISSION)

Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana read the proclamation into the record.

7. COMMISSIONER COMMUNICATIONS - Items not on the Agenda

A. COMMISSIONER BUTLER

No communication.

B. COMMISSIONER LAZAROW

Commissioner Michele Lazarow requested a meeting with Parks & Recreation Director Cathie Schanz and Interim City Manager Greg Chavarria to discuss a City beach cleanup event.

Commissioner Michele Lazarow briefed the Commission on the Women in Distress Event and encouraged the public to continue making donations.

Commissioner Michele Lazarow commended the requests of apology Resolutions from the Commission. She requested a Resolution on behalf of the City for the baseless and defamatory attacks that Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub has levied against Assistant City Manager Dr. Jeremy Earle for approximately one (1) year and to also express appreciation and support for Assistant City Manager Dr. Jeremy Earle for any kind of baseless attacks that might have affected his career.

A motion was made by Commissioner Michele Lazarow, Seconded by Commissioner Mike Butler to create an apology Resolution to Assistant City Manager Dr. Jeremy Earle. The Motion carried by the following votes:

Ayes: - 4 Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana, Mayor Joy D. Adams, Commissioner Mike Butler, and Commissioner Michele Lazarow

Nays: - 1 Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub

C. COMMISSIONER LIMA-TAUB

Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub addressed Commissioner Michele Lazarow's motion.

Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub requested the record to reflect Even Ross was sitting amongst the audience at 6:57 PM.

Motion was made by Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub to issue an apology letter to Bill Julian for the destruction and defamation of character and to Mr. Louis Birdman. The Motion failed for the lack of a second.

Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana expressed her concern with the request made by Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub.

Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub requested the City Commission to go over Roberts Rules.

City Attorney Jennifer Merino noted that staff is currently working with Mayor Joy D. Adams for a Robert Rules of Order session.

Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub requested a seed fest or vegan fest event.

Interim City Manager Greg Chavarria stated he will follow-up on the event.

Interim City Manager Greg Chavarria stated to Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub's that he is available to meet with her on any issue or concern she would like to discuss.

Discussion continued between Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub and staff, including Police Chief Sonia Quinones regarding any corruption allegations.

Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub addressed the Prom Dress Drive. She requested that Interim City Manager Greg Chavarria coordinate with high schools within the City and request what are the dates of their prom. She requested support from the Mayor and Vice Mayor to cosponsor the event.

D. VICE MAYOR JAVELLANA

Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana addressed the package mentioned by Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub noting how she and the Mayor were briefed on the situation.

Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana addressed Charter Review Committee.

City Attorney Jennifer Merino briefed the Commission on the Charter Review Committee and what is stated in the Charter.

Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana requested the item be brought back for discussion on the May or June City Commission meeting.

City Attorney Jennifer Merino stated that she will provide additional information on the item.

Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana briefed the City Commission on the Bimini dignitaries at the MLK event and inquired on the creation of a sister cities with Bimini and Nassau, Bahamas.

Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana mentioned the Black History Month and stated that she used her discretionary funds to purchase a painting and it will be unveiled this Friday at the event along with a film on the Palms.

Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana mentioned a Job Fair she is working on along with staff.

Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana spoke regarding Fair Chance Act.

Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana requested a vending machine at the police department lobby and have the proceeds go to the Police Athletic League (PAL) Program.

Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana spoke on creating a Green Events Policy and stated that she is working on creating a policy.

Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana spoke on the General Obligation (G.O.) Bonds.

Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana requested an update on the decaying home in the NW.

Development Services Director Keven Klopp provided an update on the decaying home in the NW. He clarified the process of what the action entails and the percentage needed before the property can get a demolition order and boarding responsibility.

Interim City Manager Greg Chavarria briefed the City Commission on the less paper initiative requested by Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana.

Interim City Manager Greg Chavarria provided an updated on the Broward Sherriff's Office (BSO) negotiation as requested by Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana.

E. MAYOR ADAMS

Mayor Joy D. Adams commended Assistant City Manager Dr. Jeremy Earle on the CRA event.

8. **CONSENT AGENDA (Matters on the Consent Agenda are not expected to require discussion. Items will be adopted by one motion. If discussion is desired by any member of the Commission, then that item may be pulled from the Consent Agenda by any member of the City Commission and will be considered separately. If the public wishes to speak on a matter on the Consent Agenda, they must inform the City Clerk prior to the start of the meeting. They will be recognized prior to the approval of the Consent Agenda or on the separate item, if it is pulled.)**

Item #8B was pulled from the Consent Agenda to allow Public Participation.

A motion was made by Commissioner Mike Butler, Seconded by Commissioner Michele Lazarow to approve the Consent Agenda. The Motion carried by the following votes:

Ayes: 5 - Mayor Adams, Vice Mayor Javellana, Commissioner Lazarow, Commissioner Butler, and Commissioner Lima-Taub.

Nayes: 0

- A. AFTER ACTION REPORT JANUARY 23, 2019 AND JANUARY 28, 2019. (STAFF: CITY MANAGER)

Approved on consent.

- B. A RESOLUTION OF THE MAYOR AND CITY COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF HALLANDALE BEACH, FLORIDA, AUTHORIZING PAYMENT OF LEGAL FEES INCURRED IN THE SUCCESSFUL LEGAL DEFENSE OF COMMISSIONER BILL JULIAN IN A MATTER BEFORE THE BROWARD STATE ATTORNEY'S OFFICE; PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE. (STAFF: CITY ATTORNEY)

City Clerk Jenorgen Guillen read the item into the record.

Mayor Joy D. Adams opened the floor to public participation.

Louis Birdman, Hollywood resident, spoke in support of the item.

Joseph Gibbons, Palm Beach resident, spoke in support of the item.

Anthony Sanders, Hallandale Beach resident, spoke in support of the item.

Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub requested the record to reflected Even Ross was sitting amongst the audience at 7:20 PM.

Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub requested a letter on behalf of the City Commission to Mr. Bill Julian apologizing and a resolution censoring Commissioner Michele Lazarow for what she has said to Mr. Bill Julian, to Mr. Anthony Sanders and his sons.

Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana expressed her concern with Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub's request on how to limit the involvement of PAC and developers on campaign contributions.

Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana also addressed the lobbyist fees and considering increasing the fees.

Mayor Joy D. Adams expressed her support for a letter of apology to Me. Bill Julian.

- C. A RESOLUTION OF THE MAYOR AND CITY COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF HALLANDALE BEACH, FLORIDA, AUTHORIZING A DONATION OF TWO THOUSAND FIVE HUNDRED (\$2,500) DOLLARS TO EQUALITY FLORIDA; AUTHORIZING THE CITY MANAGER TO UTILIZE FUNDS FROM THOSE ALLOCATED FOR VICE MAYOR JAVALLANA COMMISSION TRAVEL; AND PROVIDING AN EFFECTIVE DATE. (SPONSORED BY VICE MAYOR SABRINA JAVELLANA)

Approved on consent.

9. ORDINANCES ON FIRST READING

10. ORDINANCES ON SECOND READING/PUBLIC HEARING

11. RESOLUTIONS/PUBLIC HEARING

- A. A RESOLUTION OF THE MAYOR AND CITY COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF HALLANDALE BEACH, FLORIDA, APPROVING/ DENYING MAJOR DEVELOPMENT APPLICATION # DB-17-1555 FOR THE PROJECT KNOWN AS HALLANDALE BEACH TOWNHOMES LOCATED AT 920 AND 901-925 SW 9TH STREET, WITH CONDITIONS AS RECOMMENDED BY THE CITY ADMINISTRATION; AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE. (STAFF: DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DIRECTOR)

THIS ITEM IS QUASI-JUDICIAL.

THIS ITEM WAS DEFERRED ON JANUARY 23, 2019 BY A 5/0 ROLL CALL VOTE.

City Clerk Jenorgen Guillen introduced the item.

City Attorney Jennifer Merino read the quasi-judicial statement into the record.

City Clerk Jenorgen Guillen polled the City Commission regarding ex-parte communications.

Commissioner Michele Lazarow confirmed no ex-parte communications and confirmed her decision being solely based on the evidence and testimony presented at the meeting.

Commissioner Mike Butler confirmed no ex-parte communications and confirmed his decision being solely based on the evidence and testimony presented at the meeting.

Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub confirmed communications through emails with developers and staff and requested IT Department to get the emails regarding her communications regarding this item and provide them to the City Clerk and confirmed her decision being solely based on the evidence and testimony presented at the meeting.

Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana responded she spoke with previous Interim City Manager Rafols Sallaberry and confirmed her decision being solely based on the evidence and testimony presented at the meeting.

Mayor Joy D. Adams responded confirmed no ex-parte communications and confirmed her decision being solely based on the evidence and testimony presented at the meeting.

City Clerk Jenorgen Guillen swore in those individuals testifying in these proceedings including staff and the applicant.

Development Services Director Keven Klopp provided an overview of the item.

Commissioner Michele Lazarow inquired on the purpose of the Resolution.

City Attorney Jennifer Merino stated that they are a new development.

The applicant waived their right to speak.

Mayor Joy D. Adams opened the floor to public participation.

There being no comments from the public, Mayor Joy D. Adams closed the floor to public participation.

A motion was made by Commissioner Michele Lazarow, Seconded by Commissioner Mike Butler to approve the Resolution. The Motion carried by the following votes:

Ayes: 5 – Mayor Joy D. Adams, Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana, Commissioner Mike Butler, Commissioner Michele Lazarow and Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub.

Nays: 0

12. RESOLUTIONS/CITY BUSINESS

A. SANITATION SERVICES RECOMMENDATION (STAFF: PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTOR)

THIS ITEM WAS DEFERRED ON JANUARY 23, 2019 BY A 5/0 ROLL CALL VOTE.

Assistant City Manager/Director Steven Parkinson provided an overview of the item. He provided an overview regarding the services recommendations dealing with sanitation services and the privatization of those services. He stated that the recommendations are

not to privatize and keep the residential portion intact and the commercial and multifamily go to private haulers since those are the complaints received from the public. He spoke regarding the positions being reallocated to those positions which were vacant.

Assistant City Manager/Public Works Director Steven Parkinson answered questions posed by the City Commission.

There being no further discussion before the City Commission, Mayor Joy D. Adams called the question.

A motion was made by Commissioner Mike Butler, Seconded by Commissioner Michele Lazarow to approve the Resolution. The Motion carried by the following votes:

Ayes: 2 – Commissioner Mike Butler, and Commissioner Michele Lazarow

Nays: 3 - Mayor Joy D. Adams, Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana, and Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub

- B. A RESOLUTION OF THE MAYOR AND CITY COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF HALLANDALE BEACH, FLORIDA, CONDEMNING AIRBNB, INC.'S ("AIRBNB") DECISION TO REMOVE FROM ITS PLATFORM LISTINGS OF RENTAL PROPERTIES LOCATED WITHIN ISRAELI SETTLEMENTS ESTABLISHED IN DISPUTED TERRITORY WITHIN THE WEST BANK; ENCOURAGING THE STATE AND FEDERAL GOVERNMENTS TO PENALIZE AIRBNB FOR THIS DECISION; PROHIBITING REIMBURSEMENT FOR LODGING EXPENSES FOR CITY EMPLOYEES WHO BOOK THEIR LODGING FOR PUBLIC BUSINESS TRAVEL THROUGH THE AIRBNB PLATFORM; DIRECTING THE CLERK TO PROVIDE A COPY OF THIS RESOLUTION TO THE APPROPRIATE OFFICIALS; AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE. (SPONSORED BY COMMISSIONER MICHELE LAZAROW)

City Clerk Jenorgen Guillen read item into the record.

Commissioner Michele Lazarow briefed the Commission on the item.

Mayor Joy D. Adams opened the floor to public participation.

Louis Birdman, Hollywood resident, spoke on this item.

Howard Garson, Hallandale Beach resident, spoke on this item.

Mayor Joy D. Adams opened the floor to public participation.

There being no comments from the public, Mayor Joy D. Adams closed the floor to public participation.

Commissioner Mike Butler expressed his support with Mr. Garson's comments and recommended addressing only items that involve the City.

A motion was made by Commissioner Mike Butler, Seconded by Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana to request City Attorney Jennifer Merino to provide a Resolution addressing all future Resolutions must have a materiality threshold and a direct impact on the City's business. The Motion carried by the following votes:

Ayes: 3 – Commissioner Mike Butler, Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana, and Mayor Joy D. Adams.

Nays: 2- Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub and Commissioner Michele Lazarow.

Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana agreed with Commissioner Mike Butler and Mr. Garson.

Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana noted the direction to be part of the protocol manual.

City Attorney Jennifer Merino clarified the motion made by Commissioner Mike Butler, as requested by Commissioner Michele Lazarow.

There being no further discussion before the City Commission, Mayor Joy D. Adams called the question.

A motion was made by Commissioner Michele Lazarow, Seconded by Commissioner Mike Butler to approve the Resolution. The Motion carried by the following votes:

Ayes: 4 – Mayor Joy D. Adams, Commissioner Mike Butler, Commissioner Michele Lazarow and Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub.

Nays: 1 Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana

- C. A RESOLUTION OF THE MAYOR AND CITY COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF HALLANDALE BEACH, FLORIDA, DENOUNCING THE HUMANITARIAN CRISIS UNDER VENEZUELA'S DICTATOR NICOLAS MADURO; RECOGNIZING THE NEW INTERIM PRESIDENT JUAN GUAIDO; AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE. (SPONSORED BY COMMISSIONER ANABELLE LIMA-TAUB).

City Clerk Jenorgen Guillen read the item into the record.

Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub briefed the City Commission on the item.

Mayor Joy D. Adams opened the floor to public participation.

Carmen Gimenez, Hallandale Beach resident, provided an overview of the item and expressed her support.

Andreana Cassane, Hallandale Beach resident, spoke in support of this resolution and commended the Commission.

Eliaz Benaim, Hallandale Beach resident, spoke in support of this resolution.

Gustavo Acosta, former Captain of the former Venezuelan Army, spoke in support of this resolution.

Louis Birdman, Hollywood resident, spoke in support of this resolution.

There being no comments from the public, Mayor Joy D. Adams closed the floor to public participation.

There being no further discussion before the City Commission, Mayor Joy D. Adams called the question.

A motion was made by Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub, Seconded by Commissioner Mike Butler to approve the Resolution as amended and for the City Clerk to distribute executed Resolution to other Cities and the Governor's Office. The Motion carried by the following votes:

Ayes: 4 – Mayor Joy D. Adams, Commissioner Mike Butler, Commissioner Michele Lazarow and Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub.

Nays: 1 – Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana

- D. A RESOLUTION OF THE MAYOR AND CITY COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF HALLANDALE BEACH, FLORIDA, DENOUNCING THE BOYCOTT DIVESTMENT AND SANCTIONS MOVEMENT (BDS) AS AN ANTI-SEMITIC ATTEMPT TO DELEGITIMIZE ISRAEL; AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE. (SPONSORED BY COMMISSIONER ANABELLE LIMA-TAUB)

City Clerk Jenorgen Guillen read the item into the record.

Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub briefed the City Commission on the item.

Mayor Joy D. Adams opened the floor to public participation.

Louis Birdman, Hallandale Beach resident, spoke in support of this item.

There being no comments from the public, Mayor Joy D. Adams closed the floor to public participation.

There being no further discussion before the City Commission, Mayor Joy D. Adams called the question.

A motion was made by Commissioner Mike Butler, Seconded by Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub to approve the Resolution as amended to include direction to the City Clerk for distribution of executed Resolution to other Cities and the Governor's Office. The Motion carried by the following votes:

Ayes: 4 – Mayor Joy D. Adams, Commissioner Mike Butler, Commissioner Michele Lazarow and Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub.

Nays: 1 - Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana

- E. DISCUSSION OF ASSIGNMENT PAY FOR INTERIM CITY MANAGER. (SPONSORED BY MAYOR JOY D. ADAMS)

There being no discussion before the City Commission, Mayor Joy D. Adams called the question.

A motion was made by Commissioner Michele Lazarow, Seconded by Commissioner Mike Butler to approve the assignment pay for Interim City Manager Greg Chavarria. The Motion carried by the following votes:

Ayes: 5 – Mayor Joy D. Adams, Vice Mayor Sabrina Javellana, Commissioner Mike Butler, Commissioner Michele Lazarow

and Commissioner Anabelle Lima-Taub.

Nays: 0

13. CITY ATTORNEY COMMUNICATIONS - Items not on the Agenda

City Attorney Jennifer Merino provided an update on the Broward Sheriff's Office (BSO) merger.

City Attorney Jennifer Merino provided an update on the G.O. Bond and stated that they do not expire.

14. CITY MANAGER COMMUNICATIONS - Items not on the Agenda

- DISCUSSION OF PROPOSED DATES FOR PENSION WORKSHOP

Interim City Manager Greg Chavarria briefed the City Commission on the item.

Human Resources Director Radu Dodea provided a tentative date of April 15, 2019 at 2:00 p.m. to coordinate a Pension Workshop. The City Commission reached consensus on the date of the workshop.

Interim City Manager Greg Chavarria commended Assistant City Manager Dr. Jeremy Earle for his assistance with the strategy, building and analysis of the budget and Assistant City Manager/Director Steven Parkinson with recruitment of the new Public Works Director and the transition before his retirement.

Interim City Manager Greg Chavarria commended the Finance Department for their Certificate of Achievement for Excellence in Financial Reporting provided by the Government Finance Officers Association (GFOA) for the issuance of the 2017 Comprehensive Annual Financial Report (CAFR) for last year.

Interim City Manager Greg Chavarria stated that the Florida Water Environment selected Hallandale Beach to give a presentation at their meeting on February 20, 2019 at 11:30 a.m.

Mayor Joy D. Adams expressed her concerns with residents sitting in when the elected officials are interviewing the City Manager candidates.

City Attorney Jennifer Merino briefed the City Commission on the past practice of interviewing City Manager candidates.

15. INFORMATIONAL ITEMS: (No Action Required)

16. ADJOURN

There being no further business to discuss before the City Commission, the meeting adjourned without objection at 9:10 p.m.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED BY:

ATTEST:

Joy D. Adams, Mayor

Jenorgen M. Guillen, City Clerk