

DRAFT

PLANNING AND ZONING BOARD (PZB) PUBLIC MEETING SUMMARY
MONDAY, JANUARY 30, 2019
CITY HALL, COMMISSION CHAMBERS

Board Member Present: Charles Wu, Chair; Howard Garson, Vice Chair; Danny and Rick Levinson

Board Member Absent: Danny Kattan- *Excused*

Board Secretary: Cindy Bardales-Villanueva

City Attorney's Representative: Jennifer Merino

Staff Present: Keven Klopp, Christy Dominguez and Cindy Bardales-Villanueva

Meeting Start Time: 6:32 P.M.

Meeting Ending Time: 7:14 P.M.

2018 PZB ATTENDANCE

ATTENDANCE ROLL CALL:

BOARD MEMBERS	1/24	2/28	3/28	4/25	5/23	6/27	7/25	8/22	9/26	10/24	11/26	12/26
Charles Wu- <i>Chair</i>	A	CANCELLED	P	P	P	CANCELLED	P	P	P	P	P	CANCELLED
Howard Garson - <i>Vice Chair</i>	P		P	P	P		P	P	P	P	P	
Rick Levinson			P	P	P		P	P	P	P	P	
Danny Kattan							P	A	P	P	P	
Sheryl Natelson	A											
Terri Dillard	P											
Alexander Lewy	P		P	P	P							
Total Members Present	3		4	4	4		4	3	4	4	4	
Total Members Absent	2		0	0	0		0	1	0	0	0	

2019 PZB ATTENDANCE

BOARD MEMBERS	1/30	2/27	3/27	4/24	5/22	6/26	7/24	8/28	9/25	10/23	11/26	12/26
Charles Wu- <i>Chair</i>	P											
Howard Garson - <i>Vice Chair</i>	P											
Rick Levinson	P											
Danny Kattan	E											
Total Members Present												
Total Members Absent												

ATTENDANCE ROLL CALL:

Present (P)

Absent: (A)

Excused Absence (E)

Tardy: (T)

 Un-appointed

1 **1. CALL TO ORDER**

2
3 Mr. Wu called the meeting to order at 6:32 P.M.

4 **2. ROLL CALL**

5
6 Mr. Danny Kattan- *excused absence*

7
8 **3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

9
10 **4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

11 Line 73: Mr. Garson: pointed out typo "*stared*" needs to read "*stated*".

12 Line 33: Mr. Wu: unfinished sentence which read: "*The correct Planning*" unfinished sentence has
13 been deleted.

14 MR. LEVINSON MOVED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE NOVEMBER 26, 2018 PLANNING
15 AND ZONING BOARD MEETING TO INCLUDE AMENDMENTS.

16 MR. GARSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

17 MOTION PASSED BY A ROLL CALL VOTE (3-0).

18 **5. NEW BUSINESS**

19
20 1. APPLICATIONS #DB-18-2099 AND #RD-18-2100 BY RUBEN EZEKIEL IN ORDER TO
21 CONSTRUCT A COMMERCIAL RETAIL CENTER AT THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 613-625
22 WEST HALLANDALE BEACH BOULEVARD/ 616-620 S.W. 1ST STREET. (QUASI-JUDICIAL)

23
24 A. APPLICATION #DB-18-2099 FOR MAJOR DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL
25 PURSUANT SECTION 32-787 IN ORDER TO CONSTRUCT A 12,096 SQUARE FEET
26 COMMERCIAL CENTER.

27
28 B. APPLICATION #RD-18-2100 REQUESTING REDEVELOPMENT AREA
29 MODIFICATION (RAM) FROM SECTION 32-457 RELATIVE TO THE MINIMUM
30 LOADING SPACE REQUIREMENTS FOR RETAIL USES. (*PLANNING AND ZONING*
31 *BOARD ACTION IS NOT REQUIRED FOR THIS APPLICATION*)

32
33 **Polling of Ex Parte Communications (City Attorney)**

34
35 Ms. Dominguez provided a Power Point presentation and gave a summary of the item.

36
37 Mr. Joseph Kaller, Architect (Hollywood, FL): introduced his staff and Ruben Ezekiel, the property owner
38 of the project and expanded on the project's exterior façade. He recognized staff in their collaboration
39 and stated the project meets all City's requirements, except for their request of a parking load space.
40 They proposed to significant improvements to the property that will result in an enhancement of the
41 Hallandale Beach Boulevard Corridor.

42
43 Mr. Levinson: pointed out that the Applicant's Letter states the total parking count exceeds the Code
44 after already consider the loss of three parking spaces but is contradicted in the staff report which states
45 that the proposed project is 41 spaces and 41 spaces are provided.

46
47 Mr. Kaller: acknowledged the staff report is correct and the error is on the letter and agreed to revise.

48 Mr. Wu: complemented the design and uniqueness of the project. He asked if the intention was not to
49 have restaurant on the site?

Ms. Dominguez: stated that City's parking provisions would allow restaurants a based on the seating amount of the establishment.

Mr. Wu: asked if electric car stations are City's code requirements?

Ms. Dominguez: stated that it was staff's recommendation to put the electric car station on site, but it not required, and the applicant included it.

Mr. Wu: stated he agreed to placing the building close to the property line but had concerns with the (6) stores in the back which are lacking visibility. He asked if the applicant had a strategy for this design?

Mr. Kaller: stated that the initial plan was to build an "L" shape building but after further review with Development Review Committee (DRC) on ways to meet the code requirement, they felt the proposed plans would fit their design.

Mr. Wu: further commended the architect on the landscaping and including shade trees instead of using palm trees.

Mr. Kaller: recognized that the design was a group effort by City staff and themselves.

Mr. Wu: opened the public hearing.

No speakers.

Mr. Wu: closed the public hearing.

Mr. Garson: commended the design and the size of the project. He appreciated that traffic would not be an issue on 1st Street, unlike the previous larger scale project proposed to the site.

Mr. Wu: addressed previous request to staff to amend the Zoning and Land Development Code which require Planning and Zoning Board consideration of new development with more than 4,000 feet in floor area.

Mr. Wu: further stated that the threshold on square footage is significantly low and applications, such as the one being presented that meet all City's Code, the intense public hearing process is unnecessary.

Mr. Wu: He followed up by stating that the City needs to entrust City staff who are professional experts and its purpose is to protect the City's interest when reviewing small projects.

Mr. Wu: reiterated that all projects that have met the City's requirement should be allowed to move forward as administrative approval process and avoiding a hardship to developers coming in to only better our communities.

MR. GARSON MOVED THAT BASED ON THE COMPETENT AND SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE PRESENTED TODAY, I MOVE TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF THE MAJOR DEVELOPMENT PLAN SET FORTH IN APPLICATION #DB-18-2099 AND SUBJECT TO THE CONDITIONS RECOMMENDED BY CITY ADMINISTRATION AND FINDING THAT IT IS IN COMPLIANCE WITH ALL OTHER APPLICABLE LAWS, ORDINANCES OR REGULATIONS.

MR. LEVINSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

MOTION PASSED BY ROLL CALL VOTE (3-0).

- 101 2. An Ordinance of the Mayor and City Commission of the City of Hallandale Beach, Florida, Amending
102 Chapter 32, "Zoning and Land Development Code; Providing Updates to Requirements for Street Trees
103 in the Redevelopment Overlay (RDO) Area to Enhance the City's Tree Canopy; Providing for Codification;
104 Providing for Conflict; Providing for Severability; and Providing for an Effective Date.
105

106 Ms. Dominguez provided a Power Point presentation and gave a summary of the item.
107

108 Ms. Dominguez: follow-up by stating on the record that she received comments by the Chair
109 regarding the Ordinance. She read his email into the record and her responses as follows:
110

- 111 ▪ *Mr. Wu: "Line 76, is canopy species defined elsewhere in the Code?"*

112 Ms. Dominguez: affirmed and stated that "canopy species" is defined under "Definitions" as: "the
113 upper portion of the tree consisting of limbs, branches and leaves". There is also a definition of
114 "shade tree" which is defined as "a single-trunk dicot or conifer tree usually with a single stem or
115 main trunk which naturally develop a distinct and elevated crown and provide at maturity a minimum
116 shade crown of crown of 15 feet in diameter". In addition, there is a definition of Palms to make a
117 distinction between canopy trees and palms.

- 118 ▪ *Mr. Wu: "Line 82 should refer to the visibility triangle regulation elsewhere."*
119

120 Ms. Dominguez: stated vision clearance requirements are in the general Landscaping regulations
121 (Section 32-385) to clarify, we could add, at Line 79, after the word *Waterwise* "and shall comply
122 with the vision clearance requirements of Section 32-385(i)."
123

- 124 ▪ *Mr. Wu: "Line 84, what if the first street tree is an existing palm species, this new language
125 will dictate the remaining block to be palms, which defeats the intent of the change."
126*

127 Ms. Dominguez: stated that language is within the same subsection requiring street trees to be
128 canopy species and palms only at corners, etc.. She suggested that for clarification, the word
129 "canopy" could be inserted at Line 84 before the word "species".
130

- 131 ▪ *Mr. Wu: "Section e, the issue is if the planting height can be reduced due to overhead utilities,
132 that tree will ultimately will grow into the utilities. We should just cite FPL planting
133 guidelines."*

134 Ms. Dominguez: pointed out that these are supplemental regulations for the RDO. All plantings are
135 subject to the general Landscape regulations (Section 32-385) which refers to the FPL Guidelines
136 under Plant Materials (Section 32-385 (d)(2)) so she believes it would not be necessary to repeat in
137 this section.

- 138 ▪ *Mr. Wu: "I think the minimum tree height can be adjusted based on the availability of the
139 species in the nursery market."*

140 Ms. Dominguez: stated that language can be included at Line 86 that the director could modify the
141 height "If the established species is not available in the required height."

142 Mr. Levinson: summarized Ms. Dominguez's presentation and stated that the Ordinance would be
143 removing the existing overlay requirement of palm trees and require shaded trees along the Corridor.
144

145 Mr. Garson: asked if the planting on medians and side street is Florida Department of Transportation
146 (FDOT) is responsible.

Ms. Dominguez: affirmed.

Mr. Wu: stated that adding the word “not” at Line 69 of ordinance would make a complete difference to the proposed ordinance.

Ms. Dominguez: stated that is clear in the general landscape code that street trees do not count in the minimum number of trees required and it was added in this ordinance as a correction.

MR. GARSON MOVED THAT THE PLANNING AND ZONING BOARD RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF AN ORDINANCE OF THE MAYOR AND CITY COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF HALLANDALE BEACH, FLORIDA, AMENDING CHAPTER 32, “ZONING AND LAND DEVELOPMENT CODE; PROVIDING UPDATES TO REQUIREMENTS FOR STREET TREES IN THE REDEVELOPMENT OVERLAY (RDO) AREA TO ENHANCE THE CITY’S TREE CANOPY; PROVIDING FOR CODIFICATION; PROVIDING FOR CONFLICT; PROVIDING FOR SEVERABILITY; AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE.

MR. LEVINSON SECONDED THE MOTION.

MOTION PASSED BY ROLL CALL VOTE (3-0).

6. REMARKS BY THE CHAIR

Mr. Wu: followed by asking for a status on his request to convey to the City Commission to modify the ordinance to allow the Planning and Zoning Board to vote on Redevelopment Area Modifications (RAM).

Ms. Dominguez: stated that the item has been discussed but due to changes in administration his request had not moved forward but would soon.

7. LIAISON'S REPORT

Ms. Dominguez: briefed the Board on the Impact & In-Lieu Fees Workshop schedule for February 11, 2019 that the Board was invited to attend.

The Planning and Zoning Board unanimously agreed to 2019 Planning and Zoning Board Meeting Calendar.

2019											
1/30	2/27	3/27	4/24	5/22	6/26	7/24	8/28	9/25	10/23	11/26	12/26

8. NEXT SCHEDULED MEETING

Wednesday, February 27, 2019

Mr. Wu: asked if Mr. Kattan has advised he would not be able to attend tonight’s meeting?

Ms. Villanueva: confirmed that Mr. Kattan advised a month in advance that he would be out of town at a conference.

Mr. Wu: asked to note on the record as Mr. Danny Kattan absence as excused.

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 7:14 P.M.

197
198
199
200

Recording of this meeting can be made available to any member of the public upon request. Requests to hear a taping of the Planning and Zoning Board meeting, summarized above, should be submitted to the Planning & Zoning Division at or can be mailed to 400 South Federal Highway, Hallandale Beach, Florida 33009