# MICHAEL MILLER PLANNING ASSOCIATES. INC.

Land Design Municipal Planning Services Transportation Planning

May 15<sup>th</sup>, 2018

City of Hallandale Beach 400 South Federal Highway Hallandale Beach, FL 33009-6433 Attention: Christy Dominguez

Re:

**David Posnack Jewish Day School** 

Major Site Plan Review / Transportation Impact Analysis

412 SW 11th Street

North of SW 11th Street / West of SW 4th Terrace

MMPA Project No. 15-1201-0003

Dear Ms. Dominguez:

Pursuant to our proposal for professional services submitted to the City of Hallandale Beach on March 26th, 2018 by **Michael Miller Planning Associates, Inc. (MMPA)**, our office has undertaken the task of reviewing the estimated traffic impacts on the City's roadway system and properties in the vicinity of the proposed project, as well as provide comments on the Site Development Plans prepared by Synalovski, Romanik & Saye Architects, Inc. The last updated plans the City provided our office with are dated received by the City on April 11th, 2018. MMPA has participated in the City's review of a proposed Private School at this location from late 2016 to mid-2017 (previous proposal different school operator / larger student enrollment @ 420). The City Commission could not reach consensus to approve proposed 2016-17 development plan. In March 2018 a new application was filed with the City for a smaller 288-student private school to be owned / operated by the David Posnack Jewish Day School, which has a larger main campus in the Town of Davie. MMPA has examined and commented on the new site plan designs, as well as the Traffic Impact Analysis prepared by KBP Consulting, who worked on the previous 2016-17 application and studies (traffic statement updates / full traffic study). MMPA was requested to prepare our project analysis letter for upcoming meetings.

### **GENERAL PROJECT INFORMATION**

Land Use Designation:

Commercial – Neighborhood

**Zoning District**:

**Business Limited (B-L)** 

**General Location:** 

North of SW 11th Street / aka County Line Road

West of SW 4<sup>th</sup> Terrace South of SW 10<sup>th</sup> Street

Legal Description:

Lots 33-42, both included, of RO-LEN ACRES, according to the plat thereof, as recorded in Plat Book 47 at Page 48 of the public

records of Broward County, Florida.

## **PROJECT DESCRIPTION**

The consulting project architect, Synalovski, Romanik & Saye Architects, Inc., and other professionals, as agent for the current property owner, NC Equity Partners, LLC, has submitted a Major Development Plan application to the City to allow for:

(1) The construction of a new 25,000+/- gross sq. ft. (GFA) private school with a maximum enrollment of 288 students / Pre-K through 5<sup>th</sup> grade with 18 classrooms and an average of 16 students per classroom (previously 20 students per classroom).

The site is currently vacant. The redevelopment site is noted to be 1.21 acres in size. The site was used for many years as a 13,100 sq. ft. small-scale neighborhood commercial center. The building and other site improvements have been previously demolished.

The surrounding areas are exclusively low density single-family residential. The centerline of SW 11<sup>th</sup> Street (aka County Line Road) separates Broward and Miami-Dade County. The survey depicts a 50' wide right-of-way with 35' in Broward County and 15' in Miami-Dade County with 22' of pavement. At the southern edge of the 50' right-of-way a concrete barrier wall with metal security fencing on top / guardrails exists. The portion of the road corridor in Miami-Dade County is known as NE 215<sup>th</sup> Street and is used as a local access road within the Highlands Oaks (SFR) subdivision.

The latest development plan proposes one (1) "L-shaped" / two-story building near the northern and western portions of the site oriented east / west with a surface parking lot fronting on SW 11<sup>th</sup> Street / SW 4<sup>th</sup> Terrace. Forty (40) off-street parking spaces are required / provided. Vehicular access to the site is via one 24-foot wide two-way driveway connection to SW 11<sup>th</sup> Street in the southwest corner of the site and a second driveway connection to SW 4<sup>th</sup> Terrace in the middle of the site. While the latest KBP traffic engineering analysis suggests between 9 to 14 vehicle queuing spaces would be needed at the busiest time for the smaller school size, at least seventeen (17) vehicles could queue within the site for student drop-off / pick-up.

### COMPREHENSIVE PLAN / ZONING

Comprehensive Plan – The property has a Future Land Use Map (FLUM) designation of "Commercial – Neighborhood" according to a review of the adopted FLUM. The proposed use of the property would be consistent with the applicable FLUM designation of the property.

Land Development Regulations / Zoning Code –The property has an existing Zoning classification of Business Limited (B-L). The proposed use of the property is consistent with the allowable uses in the district. The site design must comply with the applicable land development regulations listed in the Code.

### PLATTING

The site is currently platted according to information provided. If a Unity of Title document does not exist at present, one should be required to tie the lots together legally.

### **BACKGROUND INFORMATION**

The information our office has received from the City to date includes a composite set of Site Development Plans prepared by Synalovski Romanik Saye Architects (Project Architects), Cordova Rodriguez & Associates, Inc. (Civil Engineers), Barranco-RLA, Inc. (Landscape Architect), as well as a development impact evaluation analysis booklet, a Traffic Impact Analysis Update prepared by KBP Consulting (Traffic Engineer) last dated May 10<sup>th</sup>, 2018, and a Site Operational Plan also prepared by KBP Consulting last dated May 10<sup>th</sup>, 2018.

The subject site was previously developed with a 13,100 sq. ft. strip commercial center that was demolished in early 2016 (as per IAR). KBP estimates that the previous commercial development theoretically generated about 1,812 daily trips / 45 AM Peak Hour trips / 153 PM Peak Hour trips. A proposed private school (420 students) at this location (2016-17) was considered by the City but not approved. KBP estimated that the previous 420-student school would have generated about 542 daily trips / 189 AM Peak Hour trips / 118 PM Peak Hour trips. Based on the new 2018 DPJDS plan (288 students) KBP estimates that about 429 daily trips / 193 AM Peak Hour trips / 98 PM Peak Hour trips will be generated by the new school.

KBP estimates the difference in vehicle trips between the former commercial development and the 2016-17 submittal would have decreased by 1,270 daily trips / increased by 144 AM Peak Hour trips / decreased by 35 PM Peak Hour trips. KBP estimates the difference in vehicle trips between the 2016-17 private school and the 2018 DPJDS will decrease by 282 daily trips / decrease 88 AM Peak Hour trips / decrease 45 PM Peak Hour trips. MMPA estimates the difference in vehicle trips between the former pre-2016 commercial development and the 2018 DPJDS will decrease by 1,383 daily trips / increase by 148 AM Peak Hour trips / decrease by 55 PM Peak Hour trips.

The City requires a Traffic Statement if less than 100 new net daily trips will be generated. A full-scale Traffic Study is required if more than 100 new net daily trips will be generated. Generally, a Traffic Statement would suffice as the traffic counts are estimated to decrease; however, in 2016-17 the City's DRC requested a full Traffic Study, as there was no recent data of traffic volumes or movements in this area of the City, and concerns were expressed about short-cut traffic movements, speeding, and vehicle queuing for student drop-off / pick-up. The 2016-17 Traffic Studies included all of the requested data and analysis. As part of the new 2018 application the City's DRC requested new traffic counts and a update of the previous tables on roadway link analysis and intersection analysis in the vicinity of the site. The May 10th, 2018 Traffic Impact Analysis updates included all of the requested data and analysis.

### **RIGHT-OF-WAY AND ACCESS DESCRIPTION**

**Right-of-Way** - The north side of the subject property fronts SW 10<sup>th</sup> Street, a two-lane (2L) local roadway. The existing right-of-way is fifty (50) feet in width, which meets the minimum right-of-way width requirement for local roadways. The east side of the subject property fronts SW 4<sup>th</sup> Terrace, a two-lane (2L) local roadway. The existing right-of-way is also fifty (50) feet in width, which meets the minimum right-of-way width requirement for local roadways. The survey notes that the existing pavement width for SW 10<sup>th</sup> Street is eighteen (18) feet and the existing

pavement width on SW 4<sup>th</sup> Terrace is 20 feet in width, as is common in many of the City's older residential areas. Modern widths for pavement widths are typically 20-24 feet in width. Since there is no access to SW 10<sup>th</sup> Street this should not be an issue, and SW 4<sup>th</sup> Terrace is already 20-feet in width.

The south side of the subject property fronts SW 11<sup>th</sup> Street (aka County Line Road), a two-lane (2L) City Collector roadway, although it is designated as a local roadway in the City's Transportation Element. The existing overall right-of-way width is fifty (50) feet, with thirty-five (35) feet in Broward County and an additional fifteen (15) feet in Miami-Dade County. On the south right-of-way line is a 4'-5' tall concrete barrier with fencing on top of the barrier generally between SW 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue and SW 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue. The existing pavement width is shown on the survey to be twenty-two (22) feet in width.

SW 11<sup>th</sup> Street often functions as a convenient short-cut to motorists trying to avoid the congestion on the City's main roadway network. The Traffic Study shows that minor speeding still occurs on SW 11<sup>th</sup> Street but to the west of the site. There is a stop sign controlled intersection on southbound SW 4<sup>th</sup> Terrace at SW 11<sup>th</sup> Street. The City has installed speed humps at a few locations along the SW 11<sup>th</sup> Street roadway length to slow speeding.

Access – As stated above vehicular access to the site is proposed via a 24-foot wide two-way driveway connection to SW 11<sup>th</sup> Street and a secondary 24-foot wide two-way driveway connection to SW 4<sup>th</sup> Terrace. The existing site has two (2) driveway connections to SW 11<sup>th</sup> Street and one driveway connection to SW 4<sup>th</sup> Terrace. The Traffic Study includes an analysis of expected and provide vehicular queuing for student drop-off and pick-up. Because of the student age groups and staggered school hours, especially for younger children, the study finds the proposed site plan / queuing system will be adequate for this use. According to the report about 9-14 vehicle spaces could handle the drop-off / pick-up, but at least 17 spaces are provided. Adequate on-site circulation will be achieved with the staging plan proposed.

## TRANSPORTATION CONCURRENCY ISSUES

The project is within the City's Urban Infill Area / Concurrency Exception Area; therefore, the project is exempt from City roadway concurrency requirements, provided mitigation is provided, since some of the major roadways are over-capacity in this area of the City. In addition, when building permits are requested Broward County may assess regional Transit Impact fees. The applicant submitted an updated (2018) Traffic Impact Analysis prepared by KBP Consulting, Inc. indicating the expected traffic on nearby roadways will not be significant or change the Level of Service (LOS). The latest roadway capacity at LOS "D" for SW 11<sup>th</sup> Street during Peak Hours is 875 trips. The current V/C ratio on SW 11<sup>th</sup> Street near the site during the AM Peak Hour is .65 at LOS D, which is about 65% of the capacity of the roadway. The current V/C ratio on SW 11<sup>th</sup> Street near the site during the PM Peak Hour is .55 at LOS D, which is about 55% of the capacity of the roadway. The nearest roadway / intersections with poor LOS are at Dixie Highway / SE 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue. Since there will be a reduction in daily and PM Peak Hour trips generated at this site from either the pre-2016 development or 2016-17 private school, the operations on the roadway network should not change. The increased AM Peak Hour trips can be accommodated on the roadway without affecting the LOS.

### TRIP GENERATION ANALYSIS

MMPA finds that the applicant's updated May 2018 KBP Traffic Impact Analysis is complete and addresses those issues previously discussed at City DRC meetings and the 2016-17 public hearings. The KBP Traffic Impact Analysis follows the MMPA Traffic Study Methodology previously prepared for this project. Again, since the new 2018 development will generate less trips (except AM Peak Hour) than the former pre-2016 commercial development and 2016-17 private school, and the roadway system is operating at an acceptable LOS the roadways should operate acceptably. Congestion at Dixie Highway / SE 1st Avenue at the county line will not change due to this new land use. It is noted the most roadway congestion on SW 11th Street occurs between SW 2nd Avenue and Dixie Highway, as a busy cut-through roadway in Miami-Dade County (NE 26th Avenue) aligns with SW 2nd Avenue in the City. The Traffic Study includes an Annual Average Daily Trip (AADT) calculation, AM Peak Hour and PM Peak Hour trip estimates as required by Sec. 32-788(g).

The updated analysis estimates this project will generate about 429 trips per day / 193 AM Peak Hour trips / 98 PM Peak Hour trips. This will result in a decrease of daily trips and Peak Hour trips from both the pre-2016 commercial development and 2016-17 private school.

## **Trip Generation Summary**

Time Period	Enter	Exit	Total
AM Peak Hour	104	89	193
PM Peak Hour	44	54	98
Daily	N/A	N/A	429

Based on the 2016-17 and recent 2018 data collection, all roadway links near the site are expected to operate at an acceptable Level of Service (LOS) either LOS. "B" or "C" – above LOS "D" the City's adopted LOS for local roadways. The recent April 2018 traffic counts indicate that traffic volumes have remained almost constant between 2016-17 and 2018, which was expected as this geographic area is generally built-out. Mathematically the nearby roadways are actually operating at LOS "A" but this LOS is not recognized – the default is LOS "D or above". The only roadway links / intersection operating poorly now is at split Dixie Highway / SE 1st Avenue and SW 11th Street (aka County Line Road). The major problem is really on the roadways in Miami-Dade County due to the dual travel directions / congestion near the Aventura hospital.

As related to signalized intersection operations the traffic study includes analysis of the intersections (primary / secondary) in proximity to the site in Table 2 of the report. In summary at present (2018) all intersections within one mile of the site operate at LOS D or above except:

Dixie Hwy. / SE 1st Ave.	LOS F	(AM Peak Hour)
Dixie Hwy. / SE 1st Ave.	LOS E	(PM Peak Hour)

The intersection currently operates at LOS E / F even without the new school traffic. The school's expected new traffic will be minor and not affect the LOS.

### SITE CIRCULATION OPERATIONAL PLAN

The May 2018 Traffic Operational Plan suggests that on-site operational actions by school staff will occur, such as the use of "cones" to direct vehicles during drop-off / pick-up periods. The 2018 plan addresses vehicle queuing, pick-up procedures, strategies to stagger drop-off / pick-up times. The plan notes that about 25% of the students will be early drop-off (7:15 AM), with about 38% of the students being dropped off at staggered times between 7:45 AM and 8:00 AM. The youngest children (grades K-2) will be dropped off between 8:00 AM and 8:15 AM. As to pick-up times the plan notes about 25% of the students (grades 3-5) will occur between 3:15 PM and 3:30 PM, with about 25% of the students (grades K-2) occurring between 3:30 PM and 3:45 PM. There will also be a large after-school program for working parents (est. at 50% of students). Based on the analysis and site design the school should operate with minimal disruptions to the neighborhood and roadway network. It is noted that the proposed David Posnack Jewish Day School will apparently have significant security enhancements (armed guards) as compared to the previous 2016-17 proposal.

Traffic movements are being restricted from using SW 4<sup>th</sup> Terrace, which serves as a primary access roadway to single family home sites in the neighborhood. This development site is an infill site, as virtually all other lands in the area are fully developed. Therefore, additional new project traffic, other than possibly more cut-thru traffic should not occur, unless redevelopment of existing sites occurs.

The previous 2016-17 application City discussions included a proposed condition that would have restricted all AM / PM Peak Hour vehicle movements to only "right-out" movements (no outbound left turns during that period). This was intended to limit interference with through traffic on SW 11<sup>th</sup> Street and not cause traffic backups in the site trying to exit eastward. However, this may cause motorists to circulate through the adjoining neighborhood. The applicant's Traffic Engineer feels this restriction is not necessary due to the smaller student population / trip generation / staggered arrival / departure times. Perhaps this restriction could be imposed during a "test period" or in the future if traffic problems occur.

As the proposed Hallandale DPJDS K-5 school is linked to a larger main DPJDS school campus in the Town of Davie, it has been mentioned that the site would serve as a pick-up / transfer location for older children (a site in the City apparently already serves as a bus pick-up site for the southeastern area of Broward County and northern Miami-Dade County). The latest 2018 operational plan states they intend to use a bus to transport older siblings to / from the Davie campus after dropping off younger children at the site. The City should ensure the bus drop-off / pick-up location (not identified on plans) not interfere with the student queueing or parking areas. MMPA suggests the City monitor this situation and include a condition in the City's approval to address this issue.

## OFF-STREET PARKING

The City's Code does not contain any off-street parking requirements for schools, which is quite typical. Both public / private schools are governed by a section of the Florida Building Code, which has a separate section for school facilities. The Florida Building Code (2014) requires

forty (40) parking spaces for this size facility (average site). The current site design includes forty (40) parking spaces. Based on the expected number of school employees (administrators / teachers / other), there should be a sufficient number of parking spaces for employees, as well as extra spaces for guests / parents. Some concern was expressed by a few DRC members about parents parking on the roadway swales occasionally rather than in the parking lot. If this occurs in the future appropriate signage can address this situation.

### COMPREHENSIVE PLAN

The City has adopted an Urban Infill Area that covers the entire City. Policy 1.3.7 of the City's Transportation Element states: "Development applications located within the boundaries of the City's urban infill or redevelopment area shall indicate traffic impacts to the local, state and Intrastate Highway system. The study will address over-capacity roadway links and intersections within the City within one (1) mile of the subject site where impact exceeds de minimus levels. Although the study will be required to address improvements to over-capacity links and/or intersections, the study shall not be limited by this approach. The study shall analyze techniques to minimize impacts on the Hallandale roadway network. These techniques shall include but not be limited to TDM applications, TSM approaches and improving multimodal access. For projects generating ...".

### LAND DEVELOPMENT REGULATIONS

Section 32-884(b)(1) of the City Code states: "The area of impact of the development (traffic shed) shall be determined by the city or traffic consultant retained by the city at the developer's expense. The traffic shed shall be that area where the primary impact of traffic to and from the site occurs."

Section 32-884(b)(2) states: "The projected level of service for roads within the traffic shed shall be calculated based on the estimated trips to be generated by the project using the most recent edition of the ITE Trips Generation Manual, or other source deemed acceptable by the City, and the Broward County TRIPS model as a basis for determining trip distribution. Traffic impact to the Intrastate Highway System shall also be identified."

Section 32-884(b)(5) states: "Where development will degrade the adopted level of service, or exceed de minimus impact levels on existing overcapacity roadways, a traffic impact study shall address improvements to the affected roadways, including intersection improvements, as well as alternative techniques to minimize traffic impacts. These techniques shall include, but not limited to, TDM, TSM and improving multi-modal access, and may be implemented in any effective combination. The City will determine the acceptability of mitigation strategies on a case-by-case basis according to criteria that include, but are not limited to, effectiveness, practicality, public safety, and consistency with the comprehensive plan."

In 2005 Broward County abandoned their previous Transportation Concurrency Exception Area (TCEA) designations in the eastern portion of the county and adopted a new county-wide Transit Oriented Concurrency (TOC) system. This system is based more on transit improvements versus roadway improvements. Basically the new system is a pay-and-go

impact fee system. The City still has its Urban Infill Area / Concurrency Exception Area. The County will address additional TOC impacts and assess impact fees for increased impacts and uses during their review for approval.

Even though the state / Broward County have moved away from traditional roadway traffic concurrency, the City (and almost every other city) still has requirements in its Comprehensive Plan and Codes.

The project is within the City's Urban Infill Area / Concurrency Exception Area; therefore, the project is exempt from City roadway concurrency requirements, provided City roadway mitigation fees are provided since roadways are or will be over-capacity in this area of the City. In addition, when building permits are requested, Broward County may assess either regional Transit Impact fees based on the exact land use.

### PEDESTRIAN AND BICYCLE COMMENTS

The survey indicates that sidewalks currently exist along SW 4<sup>th</sup> Terrace and most of SW 11<sup>th</sup> Street; however, the plans show new sidewalks on all three (3) adjoining roadways. Because of the age of the children expected to attend this school, few students are expected to walk or bicycle to the school site. If the need arises the school will make accommodations in the future.

## MASS TRANSIT COMMENTS

There is an existing BCT bus route (Route 6) that extends east / west along SW 11<sup>th</sup> Street from Dixie Highway to SW 11<sup>th</sup> Avenue. None of the City's mini-bus routes operate in this area.

### SUMMARY

In conclusion, MMPA finds that the proposed redevelopment project will generate less traffic than the previous pre-2016 commercial center, except in the AM Peak Hour. MMPA finds that the proposed DPJDS project will generate less traffic than the previously reviewed 2016-17 school submittal, including daily trips and AM / PM Peak Hours. The proposed staggered student drop-off / pick-up times will spread out the vehicle trip times. Admittedly the former commercial center was not a busy center and had fallen into disrepair in recent years, so the trip generation was reduced. The adjoining roadway system / intersections currently are operating at generally acceptable levels, except as noted at Dixie Highway / SE 1st Avenue in Miami-Dade County. The applicant's updated Traffic Impact Analysis noted that the additional new traffic from the school will not significantly impact or worsen the LOS. The applicant's onsite Traffic Operational Plan demonstrates that the site design can adequately handle the expected number of employees and student drop-off / pick-up without impacting the neighborhood. If in the future parking problems occur on the adjoining roadway swales, this can be addressed with "No Parking" signage.

Due to the City's Urban Infill designation, development is allowed to proceed despite poor LOS of roadways. The City Code does require some form of mitigation as deemed appropriate by the City to address the additional traffic impacts.

As always, should you have any questions or need to discuss issues identified herein, please feel free to contact my office.

Very truly yours,

Michael J. Miller, AICP

President