

ORALS SUMMARY RATING SHEET

RFP # FY 2016-2017-004 AUDIT SERVICES FOR CITY OF HALLANDALE BEACH AND HBCRA

	RATER 1			RATER 2			RATER 3			RATER 4		
	AC&F Alberni Caballero & Fierman, LLP	Mauldin & Jenkins, LLC	RSM US LLP	AC&F Alberni Caballero & Fierman, LLP	Mauldin & Jenkins, LLC	RSM US LLP	AC&F Alberni Caballero & Fierman, LLP	Mauldin & Jenkins, LLC	RSM US LLP	AC&F Alberni Caballero & Fierman, LLP	Mauldin & Jenkins, LLC	RSM US LLP
Qualifications, Expertise and Experience - Maximum 25 points	17.0	24.0	25.0	17.0	21.0	20.0	21.0	21.0	25.0	10.0	14.0	25.0
Specific Audit Approach - Maximum 25 points	20.0	23.0	25.0	21.0	22.0	23.0	22.0	25.0	25.0	15.0	20.0	25.0
Past Performance (References) - Maximum 10 points	10.0	10.0	10.0	9.0	10.0	9.0	8.0	9.7	8.0	10.0	10.0	9.9
Cost Proposal Maximum 30 points	24.3	30.0	17.6	24.3	30.0	17.6	24.3	30.0	17.6	24.3	30.0	17.6
City of Hallandale Beach Local Vendor Preference - Maximum 2.5 - 10 points	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
TOTAL POINTS	71.3	87.0	77.6	71.3	83.0	69.6	75.3	85.7	75.6	59.3	74.0	77.5

	RATER 5			RATER 6			RATER 7			RATER 8		
	AC&F Alberni Caballero & Fierman, LLP	Mauldin & Jenkins, LLC	RSM US LLP	AC&F Alberni Caballero & Fierman, LLP	Mauldin & Jenkins, LLC	RSM US LLP	AC&F Alberni Caballero & Fierman, LLP	Mauldin & Jenkins, LLC	RSM US LLP	AC&F Alberni Caballero & Fierman, LLP	Mauldin & Jenkins, LLC	RSM US LLP
Qualifications, Expertise and Experience - Maximum 25 points	20.0	24.0	24.0	20.0	24.0	24.0	19.0	19.0	25.0	20.0	18.0	25.0
Specific Audit Approach - Maximum 25 points	20.0	25.0	25.0	22.0	22.0	24.0	20.0	21.0	25.0	20.0	13.0	25.0
Past Performance (References) - Maximum 10 points	10.0	9.0	7.0	9.0	9.0	9.0	9.0	9.0	10.0	8.0	10.0	8.0
Cost Proposal Maximum 30 points	24.3	30.0	17.6	24.3	30.0	17.6	24.3	30.0	17.6	24.3	30.0	17.6
City of Hallandale Beach Local Vendor Preference - Maximum 2.5 - 10 points	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
TOTAL POINTS	74.3	88.0	73.6	75.3	85.0	74.6	72.3	79.0	77.6	72.3	71.0	75.6

ORALS SUMMARY RATING SHEET

RFP # FY 2016-2017-004 AUDIT SERVICES FOR CITY OF HALLANDALE BEACH AND HBCRA

	AC&F Alberni Caballero & Fierman, LLP	Mauldin & Jenkins, LLC	RSM US LLP
RATER 1 TOTAL	71.3	87.0	77.6
RATER 2 TOTAL	71.3	83.0	69.6
RATER 3 TOTAL	75.3	85.7	75.6
RATER 4 TOTAL	59.3	74.0	77.5
RATER 5 TOTAL	74.3	88.0	73.6
RATER 6 TOTAL	75.3	85.0	74.6
RATER 7 TOTAL	72.3	79.0	77.6
RATER 8 TOTAL	72.3	71.0	75.6
TOTAL ALL RATERS	571.4	652.7	601.7
RANK	3	1	2

The Evaluation Committee recommends the highest ranked firm for contract award and negotiations. Comments from the Evaluation Committee related to points that will need to be addressed for negotiations are:

NONE