

DRAFT

**PLANNING AND ZONING BOARD (PZB) PUBLIC HEARING SUMMARY
WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 22, 2017
CITY HALL, COMMISSION CHAMBERS
HALLANDALE BEACH, FLORIDA**

ATTENDANCE ROLL CALL:**2017 PZB ATTENDANCE**

Board Members	1/25	2/22	3/22	4/26	5/24	6/28	7/26	8/23	9/27	10/25	11/29	12/21
Sheryl Natelson - Chair	CANCELLED	A										
Terri Dillard- Vice Chair		A										
Charles Wu		P										
Alexander Lewy		P										
Howard Garson		P										
Harriett Ginsberg- Alter		P										
Total Members Present		4										
Total Members Absent		2										

Present **(P)**Absent: **(A)**Tardy: **(T)**

 Un-appointed
 Special Meeting

Staff in Attendance:

Althea Jefferson
Christy Dominguez
Cindy Bardales
Andre McKenney

1 **1. CALL TO ORDER**

2
3 Mr. Wu called the meeting to order at 6:42 P.M.

4
5 **2. ROLL CALL**

6
7 Ms. Natelson and Ms. Dillard were absent.

8
9 **3. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

10
11 **4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

12
13 MR. GARSON MOVED TO MAKE CHANGE TO FEC ABBREVIATION SHOULD BE FLORIDA
14 EAST COAST (FEC) IN LINE ITEM 28 AND REQUESTED STAFF TO CONFIRM STATEMENT.

15
16 MS. GINSBERG SECONDED THE MOTION.

17
18 MOTION PASSED BY A ROLL CALL VOTE (4-0).

19
20 **5. NEW BUSINESS**

21
22 NC EQUITY PARTNERS, LLC, REQUESTING MAJOR DEVELOPMENT PLAN APPROVAL
23 AND A VARIANCE TO DEVELOP THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 412 SW 11TH STREET AS
24 A NEW SCHOOL.

25
26 THE APPLICATIONS TO BE CONSIDERED ARE AS FOLLOWS:

27
28 1. APPLICATION# DB-16-03577, FOR MAJOR DEVELOPMENT REVIEW APPROVAL
29 PURSUANT TO SECTION 32-782 OF THE ZONING AND LAND DEVELOPMENT CODE TO
30 CONSTRUCT A NEW 25,022 SQUARE FEET SCHOOL (PRE-K THRU 5TH GRADE) WITH
31 CLASSROOMS, ADMINISTRATION OFFICES, CAFETERIA AND OPEN PLAY AREA.

32
33 2. APPLICATION# V-16-03579 REQUESTING A VARIANCE FROM SECTION 32-149 (D)(4)
34 RELATIVE TO THE MAXIMUM HEIGHT ALLOWED OF BUILDINGS IN THE B-L,
35 BUSINESS-LIMITED DISTRICT WHICH ARE NOT LOCATED ON HALLANDALE BEACH
36 BOULEVARD OR U.S. 1.

37
38 **Polling of Ex Parte Communications (Board Secretary)**

39
40 *Mr. Wu advised that he had no Ex-Parte Communications regarding this matter. He advised*
41 *he would base his decision solely on the testimony being presented.*

42
43 *Mr. Lewy advised that he had no Ex-Parte Communications regarding this matter. He advised*
44 *he would base his decision solely on the testimony being presented.*

45
46 *Mr. Garson advised that he had no Ex-Parte Communications regarding this matter. He*
47 *advised he would base his decision solely on the testimony being presented.*

48
49 *Ms. Ginsberg advised that she had no Ex-Parte Communications regarding this matter. She*
50 *advised she would base her decision solely on the testimony being presented.*
51

Swearing in of Witnesses (Deputy City Attorney)

The oath was administered by the Deputy City Attorney to all staff and public attendees that would be speaking on the case.

Ms. Dominguez: provided a PowerPoint presentation and gave a summary of the item.

Mr. Garson asked if applicant were to proposed three feet less, would the applicant be meeting code.

Ms. Dominguez: agreed.

Mr. Wu: asked if reducing the building by feet three stories would eliminate the Variance application?

Ms. Dominguez: Agreed. She added that the Major Development application approval would still be required since the project is more than 4,000 square feet.

Mr. Manny Synalovski, Architect (1800 Eller Drive, Suite 500 Fort Lauderdale, FL 33316): stated the applicant agrees to staff recommendations. However, they have an objection to the amount proposed of \$115,596.00 for the City's transportation mitigation fee for the following reasons:

- The proposed school distance to actual transportation ways.
- The previous shopping plaza, retail use generated more trips than what is being proposed.
- The City's Zoning and Land Development Code references peak hours.

Mr. Wu: opened the Public Hearing.

Catherine Vega (708 S.W. 11th Street Hallandale Beach, FL 33009): stated she was opposed to the proposed project for the following reasons and concerns:

- The Traffic Study being presented by the applicant being performed during the holiday hours when there a lot of families away from home.
- Has concerns about 166 students being released in a two-way street.
- 40 Parking spaces being proposed being sufficient for only school faculty. She believed parents would be parking in her swale in events such as, Honor Assemblies and Parent and Teacher Night when the entire school is invited to the school.
- They currently have business trucks, FedEx and UPS driving through their homes trying to avoid the traffic and believes that having a school at this location would increase traffic by school buses and delivery trucks going to the site.

Michelle Mason (720 S.W. 11th Street Hallandale Beach, FL 33009): stated she was also opposed to the project and further stated that a proposed private school would not be a benefit to other schools in the City. They would be bringing children from other cities.

Mr. Wu: closed the Public Hearing.

Mr. Synalovski: advised that he was open to meet with the public speakers to go over any concerns they might have but believe the following statements might answer their questions:

- The Traffic Study was prepared on November 16, 2016, which was the date requested by staff and the study was based on a significant amount of distance.
- Since the proposed project is a private school they will have different of drop-off/pick-up time frames.

- There will be no cooking on site, children will be required to bring lunches; therefore, there will not be delivery trucks in and out of the site.
- The community would benefit from this school and any child would be allowed to apply.
- The project will have a sophisticated drop-off and pick-up process in which the parent authorized to pick-up the child would have a queuing system that would notify the school the parent car is arriving and faculty would bring the child to the port area for pick-up.
- Parents will not be permitted to park their car to drop-off their child. Therefore, the queuing system has been put in place to avoid traffic from parents coming in to pick-up their children.
- If a parent would like to visit the site, they will be required to schedule an appointment.
- There is a maximum capacity of 20 students per class room. He added that by Building Code they are not able to exceed this capacity, which means 420 students is the maximum.
- They do not anticipate buses, maybe only carpooling.

Mr. Wu: asked were bicycle racks proposed?

Mr. Synalovski: stated that during the Development Review Committee (DRC) process they agreed that bicycle racks would be eliminated.

Ms. Ginsberg: asked what would be the grade level the school would be offering?

Mr. Synalovski: stated Pre-K to 5th grade.

Mr. Garson: stated he had concerns with the water use and asked staff if Green Certification was required?

Ms. Dominguez: stated that Green Certification is required for development over exceeding 50,000 square footage, which this project does not.

Mr. Synalovski: further stated that to do a green project they have committed to the following:

- No cooking on the site which that would conserve water;
- Natural lighting throughout the building and student classrooms;
- Glassing on the west side of the building for clean light;
- Air quality (CO2) sensors;
- White roof that reflects heat; and
- Not using VOC material for furniture or glue.

Mr. Lewy: asked about Ben Gamla, a previous school being proposed and how was this project different?

Ms. Dominguez: stated that the Ben Gamla project site was zoned RD-12 and required the applicant to apply for Conditional Use application. Schools is a permitted use in the Commercial zoning of this property.

Mr. Lewy: recommended applying additional mitigation fees to ensure that there is no parking on the swales.

Mr. Wu: asked if the applicant was required to host a Community Meeting for proposed project?

Ms. Dominguez: stated that it was not a requirement.

Mr. Wu: asked of the applicant was given credit for demolishing of current building.

Ms. Dominguez: clarified that the traffic study issued credit for the previous use and considered new trips.

Mr. Wu: asked the public if anyone would like to speak further on the item in hopes of answering any concern they might still have?

Ms. Vega: stated that the queuing system being proposed was not realistic and predicts that parents will be queuing the school of their arrival time, which will hold up cars that arrive on time causing a line of cars lined up on their street. She added that the applicant did not discuss the anticipated time to construct the school.

MR. WU STATED BASED ON THE COMPETENT AND SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE PRESENTED TODAY I MOVE THAT THE PLANNING AND ZONING BOARD RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF THE PROPOSED VARIANCES FOR APPLICATION # V-16-03579 TO THE CITY COMMISSION SUBJECT TO THE CONDITIONS RECOMMENDED BY CITY ADMINISTRATION.

MR. LEWY SECONDED THE MOTION.

MOTION PASSED BY ROLL CALL VOTE (4-0).

MR. GARSON MOTIONED BASED ON THE COMPETENT AND SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE PRESENTED TODAY, I MOVE TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL TO THE CITY COMMISSION OF APPLICATION 2016-3057-DB AT 501 SE 1ST AVENUE FOR MAJOR DEVELOPMENT REVIEW PURSUAN APPLICATION #DB-16-03577 TO SECTION 32-782 OF THE HALLANDALE BEACH ZONING AND LAND DEVELOPMENT CODE SUBJECT TO THE CONDITIONS RECOMMENDED BY CITY ADMINISTRATION AND WITH THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATION:

- 1) NO COOKING ON THE SITE;**
- 2) MAXIMUM OF 420 STUDENT; AND**
- 3) THE TRAFFIC OPERATION PLAN SHALL BE AMENDED AS DEEMED NECESSARY BY STAFF.**

MS. DILLARD SECONDED THE MOTION.

MOTION PASSED BY ROLL CALL VOTE (3-1). MR. LEWY- NO

6. REMARKS AS REQUESTED BY THE CHAIR

Mr. Garson: stated that he wanted to place on record the remarks given by Commissioner Annabelle Taub at a Commission Meeting, referencing the Planning and Zoning Board as "The Board was a total waste of time". He stated that he was insulted and wanted to place on the record that the Planning and Zoning Board members may not have knowledge to everything but the Board was not a waste of time as she mentioned.

Ms. Jefferson: interjected and suggested that any Board member that would like to discuss remarks given by Commissioner Annabelle Taub are asked to schedule a meeting with herself or Mr. Klopp, Director of Development Services in a more appropriate setting.

7. NEXT SCHEDULED MEETING

A. January 25, 2017

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 8:47 P.M.

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED:

RECORDED:

Cindy Bardales, Board Secretary

Chair, Sheryl Natelson

ATTEST:

Althea Jefferson, Liaison

A Recording of this meeting can be made available to any member of the public upon request. Requests to hear a taping of the Planning and Zoning Board meeting, summarized above, should be submitted to the Planning & Zoning Division at \or can be mailed to 400 South Federal Highway, Attn. Althea P. Jefferson, Hallandale Beach, Florida 33009.